***Table 1: Summary of all included primary studies***

| **Author** | **Title** | **Month** | **Level** | **Learners** | **Specialty  (or N/A)** | **Region** | **Organization  responsible** | **Focus of development** | **Stated purpose of deployment** | **Brief summary of development or intervention** | **Resources (details of cost / time / resources)** | **Kirk-patrick  Outcome** | **Other Outcomes  (QI, impact, policy change, checklist, etc.)** | **Summary of Results (main details)** | **Lessons Learnt by development as stated by authors (barriers, challenges)** | **Summary of conclusion** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Abraham et al. | Engaging Third-Year Medical Students on Their Internal Medicine Clerkship in Telehealth During COVID-19 | June | UME | 3rd year medical students; n=20 | Internal medicine | USA | Academic hospital | Telehealth | Provide a diverse patient care experience despite COVID restrictions and increase skill and confidence with telehealth | Telehealth module for internal medicine clerkship: 1. Complete American College of Physicians online module on telehealth https://www.acponline.org/cme-moc/online-learning-center/telemedicine-a-practical-guide-for-incorporation-into-your-practice;  2. Attend Zoom orientation; 3. Attend once weekly supervised telehealth clinic. | Learning modules on telehealth (2 hours); Zoom orientation with 2 faculty members (1.5 hours); 30-minute patient appointments (6-8 per session, once weekly); Doximity dialer to mask phone number | 1, 2a, 2b | ND | Student familiarity and comfort with performing assessment and exam via telehealth improved, however there was a wide range of comfort. Students were more confident in their ability to assess social determinants of health than the physical exam. Students were highly satisfied. Adequate case mix exposure. | Used online modules successfully; Formal assessment of telehealth was difficult, and feedback was informal --> checklist development could be useful; Challenge was short time frame for development | "We successfully developed a robust model in which medical students not only actively participated in, but also actively delivered, telehealth care to our patients." Success needs to be built on and expanded as telehealth is here to stay. |
| Aluisio et al. | Academic-humanitarian partnerships: leveraging strengths to combat COVID-19 | August | CME | HCW: clinical providers, support staff, public health personnel, local policymakers at TOT sessions;  n = >900 | Multi-professional | Inter-national | Collaboration between international humanitarian group and a university | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Provide practical knowledge on preparing health systems and frontline providers for the COVID-19 pandemic | The program targets trainers of trainees (TOTs). Trainers disseminate what they have learned at TOT sessions. Teaching and evaluation focus on core competencies across eight modules: COVID-19 principles, infection prevention and control, screening and triage, diagnosis and management, stabilization and resuscitation, surge capacity, surveillance and risk communication and community education. Program is based on "vetted" materials from widely respected organizations such as WHO. | Not well detailed, but partnered with humanitarian organization, Project HOPE, which contributed substantial manpower | ND | Global impact on healthcare personnel readiness to treat patients with COVID in low- and lower-middle-income countries | >900 TOTs have trained >22,000 frontline healthcare personnel | Barriers included 1. logistical coordination (access to local personnel), 2. technology access (bandwidth limitations required audio-only alternatives at some sites), and 3. management of content matter volume (rapid evolution of COVID-19 data required 2 trainers, one focused on set materials and one on the most up-to-date research) | "Collaborative academic-humanitarian programs represent a viable approach to strengthen the response to global healthcare crises. The developed and implemented COVID-19 digital training program is a key example of how academic-humanitarian partnerships can be leveraged to strengthen healthcare training and capacity during pandemics." |
| Amin et al. | Step-by-step Guide to Create Competency-Based Assignments as an Alternative for Traditional Summative Assessment | June | UME | 3rd year medical students | N/A | Middle East | University | Assessment | Replace traditional summative assessments with competency based electronic assignments | 5 step model used to design an integrative, competency-based assignment as an alternative to summative assessment. Assignment consisted of writing questions for a question bank. Students were assigned specific integrated lectures and tasked with developing a case scenario. Rubrics for grading were developed by faculty. | Training sessions for staff; Zoom sessions for students on item-writing; Template for item-writing | 1 | ND | Students were satisfied with the assignment of writing questions | Student engagement was helpful | "An integrated competency-based assignment can be well-tailored to an enthusiastic project, not only to provide a fair assessment but also, to create a usable product. Students' engagement in the needs assessment, design, plan, implementation, and evaluation of the end product maximize the outputs to unexpected horizons" |
| Andreae et al. | Healthcare simulation to prepare for the COVID-19 pandemic | May | CME | Anesthesia physicians;  n = 7 | Anes-thesiology | USA | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Use immersive training simulations to test algorithms and protocols and optimize management of suspected COVID 19 patients | Immersive in-situ training simulation with 4 scenarios related to COVID 19: cardiac arrest, emergency airway management, tele-instruction for remote guidance and supervision, and transporting an intubated patient. Scenarios required PPE use, procedures. One included a telemedicine link to an "expert" who was tasked with guiding team remotely. | (Details provided in companion paper below) | ND | QI;: Impact on organizational behavior, leading to changed scope of practice, altered resuscitation algorithms, awareness of resource crisis. | Simulations revealed gaps in policy, practice/behaviors, and preparedness | Teams were surprised by time necessary to safely intubate, identified barriers to communication created by PPE, adjusted difficult airway protocols and resuscitation algorithms. | "Simulation impacted organizational behavior, leading to changed scope of practice, altered resus algorithms, raised awareness of impending resource crisis" |
| Andreae et al. | Data and debriefing observations on healthcare simulation to prepare for the COVID-19 pandemic (companion paper to above) | July | CME | Anesthesia physicians;  n = 7 | Anes-thesiology | USA | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Test protocols developed in tabletop exercises, augment the organizational response by improving interdisciplinary coordination, and triangulate simulation debriefings with participants. | Immersive in-situ training simulation with 4 scenarios related to COVID 19: cardiac arrest, emergency airway management, tele-instruction for remote guidance and supervision, and transporting an intubated patient. Detailed "expected action" steps (Table 3). | Detailed description of needed materials (e.g., manikin, height adjustable, gurney, crash cart, difficult airway kit, etc.) No details regarding time or cost. | 2b; 4a | QI; Impact on organizational behavior, leading to changed scope of practice, altered resuscitation algorithms, awareness resource crisis. | Identified overarching themes from debriefings. The themes demonstrate learning and suggests ideas for practice change (e.g., Airway instrumentation and mask ventilation expose clinicians to virus aerosolization"). See table 2. | ND | ND |
| Ansari et al. | The effects of personal protective equipment on airway management: An in-situ simulation | July | Mixed | Trainees, attendings, staff; n = 34 | Anes-thesiology | Europe | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Evaluate airway management procedures using a skill specific checklist during a simulated difficult airway scenario. Evaluate the time to successful tracheal intubation. | In situ simulation with structured scenario with video review performance checklist, followed by debriefing, additional training on doffing PPE and the training on video laryngoscopy. | over 2 weeks, using high fidelity simulation equipment already available | 2b | ND | 12% failure rate in tracheal intubation and longer time for intubation as compared to previously published studies from the same department using a video laryngoscope | ND | Following structured training, procedural steps can be performed to an acceptable level of competence. Additional training with newly introduced devices (e.g., McGrath® video laryngoscope) is of paramount importance. |
| Ashton et al. | Junior doctors: when fresh blood fast-tracks the fight against COVID-19 | Sept-ember | GME | Residents;  n = 578 | Multi-disciplinary | Europe | Academic hospitals | Service | Highlight the efficiency millennial residents can bring at a time of crisis (by means of being more technologically savvy and their capacity in fast networking with their peers) | A Crisis Management Team (CMT) was established to identify staffing needs and dispatch resident volunteers. CMT had two arms - The Monitoring Team and Matching Teams. The monitoring team would assess the needs of departments. Needs were stratified, levels 1-5 to signify urgency of need. Level 4 and 5 needs triggered the matching team to carry out workforce recruitment. | Social networks; Novel web app to sort and organize volunteers that took 48 hours to develop | ND | Volunteers matched to need / dispatched to fill critical staffing gaps (impact on system) | 1902 residents responded to the CMT call; 578 were actually dispatched; 230 in ICUs, 93 in Eds and 255 in inpatient wards | The CMT reflected the potential of millennial junior doctors / residents to take the lead in times of crisis. | The CMT provided a reliable and agile answer to hospital staffing needs, due to the familiarity of those involved with social networking and information communication technology (ICT) tools. |
| Astani et al. | Radiology Department and Residency Program Response and Adaption to COVID 19 | July | GME | Residents;  n = ~130 | Radiology | Middle East | Academic hospitals | Clinical service reconfiguration, Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Provide reliable interpretation of radiographic scans while addressing the patient surge; Ensure uninterrupted training of radiology residents | 2 teams were created: one core radiograph interpretation team and one of redeployed residents assisting under the clinical supervision of internal medicine and infectious disease doctors. Lectures were moved online and presented live. Webinar and Q&A sessions were also set up online. Eventually case presentations, weekly journal clubs, and monthly grand rounds were also switched to a virtual format. | ND | 1 | Augmented staffing on other services | 98% resident satisfaction regarding the novel online teaching activities | Virtual and online lectures cannot replace some necessary in-person training. | Residents cannot learn certain skills virtually (e.g., ultrasound scanning) |
| Ayoub et al. | Medical Student Mobilization During a Pandemic: The Ochsner Clinical School Response to COVID-19 | July | UME | 3rd & 4th Year Medical Students;  n = 151 | N/A | USA | Academic hospital | Service | Integrate volunteer medical students into projects addressing the needs of the Louisiana health system | 6 projects emerged based on needs: COVID-19 Call Center, Obstetrics Call Center, PPE Initiative, COVID-19 Diagnostic RT-qPCR Laboratory Testing, MedVantage Clinic Telemedicine, and Family Communication Champion Project. Students supported triage efforts, addressed PPE shortages, assisted with diagnostic efforts, discussed care with families separated from hospitalized patients, and ensured access to health maintenance appointments for disadvantaged persons. | ND | 2a, 2b | 3,625 volunteer hours impacted community and healthcare | Students learned 1. relevant medical knowledge reviewing patient charts, 2. interprofessional collaboration in healthcare teams, 3. empathy and listening skills, 4. leadership skills. Call center wait times decreased from 3 hours to 0; 632 OB patients had questions answered; 379 chronically ill geriatric patients were reached via telemedicine; 15,000 COVID-19 samples were analyzed; a novel face shield was developed using 3D printing; and PPE was distributed to frontline health workers. | "...medical students can provide essential assistance to the medical workforce in the event of a major disaster or global crisis." | Medical students are ideal candidates for identifying and addressing gaps in healthcare. They have also shown their determination and resilience through service projects during the COVID-19 pandemic. |
| Babal et al. | First, Do No Harm: Lessons Learned From a Storytelling Event for Pediatric Residents During the COVID-19 Pandemic | May | GME | Residents;  n = 37 | Pediatrics | USA | University | Well-being / mental health / learner support | Determine if narrative storytelling can support resident growth and wellbeing in times of crisis | 2-hour online storytelling event: Faculty storytellers attended a 1-hour workshop. 3 faculty members told stories, each lasting 8-10 mins about meaningful or challenging clinical experiences related to COVID-19. Storytelling was followed by facilitated discussion. | Blackboard videoconferencing platform; 3 faculty storytellers; Storytelling workshop; professional storyteller to give feedback; session facilitator. | 2a | ND | Majority of residents reported hearing faculty tell stories was beneficial for their emotional growth (n = 13, 76.5%) and professional growth (n = 11, 64.7%) and they wanted more in the future (n = 12, 70.6%). Fewer said that it was cathartic n=9, 52.9%). | May be beneficial for some but may be distressing for others. Trauma-informed practice may be needed. | Storytelling about stressful events can be helpful but can be potentially triggering. Joyful stories may be welcomed. |
| Balakrishnan et al. | A novel "Google Classroom" based pathology education tool for trainees during COVID-19 pandemic: Impactful learning while social distancing | August | GME | Pathology trainees (residents or fellows) | Pathology | Inter-national | Collaboration of pathologists | Pivot to online learning (asynchronous) Assessment | Supplement learning (lost case exposure) by leveraging technology | An international collaboration of pathologists developed a "Breast Case Challenge". Teachers posted a new case weekly with a clinical vignette, a PPT, a set of microscope images and a series of questions. Learners post their differential diagnosis and request additional studies. Mid-week there is follow up discussion. | Online platform which is free. No other costs or resources discussed. | 1 | ND | Survey of participants highlighted open access to learning resources, opportunities for networking and collaboration, tolerance to others' opinions and a forum for consensus and common ground. | Interactive dialogue, learning from others and consensus building. Questions serve as a self-evaluation tool. | Online learning platforms are an effective way to develop learning in pathology during the COVID pandemic. Google classroom is a more professional alternative than Facebook's discussion forums. |
| Bandi et al. | Strategies to overcome limitations in Otolaryngology residency training during the COVID-19 pandemic | July | GME | Residents in Otolaryngology; n = 15 | Oto-laryngology | Europe | Academic hospital | Clinical service reconfiguration, Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Report strategies to overcome the educational constraints caused by COVID-19 | Clinical teams were created to cover inpatient, outpatient and surgical services. Ensured not all residents in the same place at the same time to reduce exposures. Teaching activities were shifted online, including lectures, journal clubs and case conferences. Multi-disciplinary tumor boards were conducted virtually. Dissection labs were held with social distancing measures to mimic surgeries. | ND | 1 | ND | Most useful activities were dissection (n=8, 53.4% residents) and online journal clubs/webinars (n=7, 46.6% of residents). Suggestions included actively participating in tracheostomy procedures on COVID patients, attending lessons by senior consultants on ENT topics and promoting collegial discussion of inpatient cases. | Understanding what the residents perceived as useful training during the pandemic can guide future interventions | Residents perceived decreased surgical training and suggested dissection labs, live surgery videoconferencing and online didactics to supplement training. |
| Bautista et al. | Development of an interprofessional rotation for pharmacy and medical students to perform telehealth outreach to vulnerable patients in the COVID-19 pandemic | August | UME | Pharmacy students; 3rd year medical students;  n = 5 | Inter-professional | USA | University | Telehealth | Teach students interprofessional and communication skills while having them provide outreach to vulnerable patients | 6 sessions across 2 weeks; 1st = 2-hour induction. Each subsequent session had a 30-minute didactic "huddle" followed by a 2-hour outreach, where students collaboratively reviewed patient notes and performed follow up calls. Help was available from an offline preceptor if needed. Students presented patient encounters to preceptors. | Zoom; Electronic Health Record; Doximity application to call patients; 7 preceptors + 2 directors met on zoom 2x1hour; Staff scheduled follow up appointments. | 1, 2b | ND | All students agreed that they achieved learning objectives; and rated pre and post encounter huddles, outreach, medicine reconciliation as good, very good, or excellent. Gained skills in telehealth. | Technology issues; low rates of patients answering calls; no pre-intervention survey | This interprofessional rotation was well received by students and addresses trends in healthcare delivery, specifically an increasing reliance on telehealth, distance learning, and need for IPE in the workplace. |
| Beer et al. | Megaflip, a Novel Approach to National Collaboration for Flipped Classroom Education | June | GME | Fellows in training from 16 neo-natology and pulmonary fellowship programs;  n = 131 | Pediatrics (Neonatal-Perinatal Medicine) | USA | National organization of neonatal-perinatal medicine program directors | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Provide high quality education to fellow trainees as recommended by the ACGME | Use of flipped classroom model for neonatal fellowship programs using national neonatology curriculum, materials and resources. Learners are assigned prework (short videos and readings). Classroom sessions focus on case-based application. “Megaflip” sessions are delivered via Zoom. A small group of facilitators (2−3) host the Megaflip and the participating programs provide a local facilitator to lead their own fellows in large group and breakout discussions. | ND | 1 | ND | A megaflip model of flipped classroom across fellowship programs in the USA was conducted for 2 sessions (131 fellows from 16 programs). Survey results highlighted the utility of megaflip and its impact on fellow education. | Coordination among national programs is possible and well received. | The Megaflip is feasible and useful. Plan to continue model beyond the pandemic given advantages of opportunity for multicenter collaboration, reduced burden on faculty facilitators, and expanding fellow exposure to center-specific innovations and practice patterns. |
| Bhashyam & Dyer | Virtual Boot Camp: Orthopaedic Intern Education in the Time of COVID-19 and Beyond | July | GME | 1st year orthopedic residents | Orthopedic surgery | USA | Academic hospitals | Pivot to online learning (asynchronous) | Create an asynchronous learning platform allowing residents to develop basic orthopedic knowledge and skills | Month long virtual bootcamp for 1st year residents used asynchronous, modular instruction of knowledge and skills. Available at https://ortho.hms.harvard.edu/virtual-bootcamp. Topics organized into modular weekly format to facilitate focused skills development. 4 modules were basic skills/hand, sport, trauma, and arthroplasty. Lectures presented via Zoom. Skill modules completed remotely. | Breakdown of resources and costs presented in tables. On average, $1700 was required per intern, $1400 for startup and $300 over the subsequent sessions. | 1 | ND | 100% of residents were satisfied by the course, the modular format, and the “take-home” kits. All residents reported “virtual” boot camp improved their orthopedic knowledge base and surgical skills. 92% of residents thought it improved their preparedness for the operating room. All residents thought that it should be a permanent part of resident education. | Limited evaluation of learners' knowledge improvement and hands on technical skills | A virtual boot camp for cognitive and technical skill learning for orthopedic residents is feasible and well received by learners. |
| Blankenburg et al. | Virtual Cafes: An Innovative Way for Rapidly Disseminating Educational Best Practices and Building Community During COVID-19 | June | CME | Pediatric program directors; n=255 | Pediatrics | USA | National organization of pediatric program directors | Well-being / mental health / learner support | Share educational innovations and best practices as well as build community and consensus | Daily, 1-hour, Zoom videoconferences "Virtual Cafes" hosted by the board. Sessions on COVID-related GME issues: short presentation of ideas, followed by open dialogue and information sharing verbally and through the chat function | zoom, program directors to plan sessions | 2a | Increased engagement with the association of pediatric program directors and its members | "Members noted that these cafes resulted in significant changes in their approaches to educational, clinical, and administrative issues." | Carry on with sessions | "Virtual Cafes are a successful way to engage membership, build community, and quickly disseminate innovative educational practices" |
| Buckley | Faculty development in the COVID-19 pandemic: So close - yet so far | May | CME | N/A | N/A | Canada | Regionally dispersed faculty group | Faculty development | Develop a virtual platform for faculty development using social networking | A provincial virtual faculty development session was developed to bring four regionally dispersed faculty staff groups together to learn with and from each other. Regional leads and site administrators reached out to faculty. Experts were invited to help bridge knowledge gaps around virtual learning. Formal presentations were avoided to encourage spontaneous informal discussion. Continuity of connection was offered afterwards through email. | ND | 1 | ND | "Overall this form of 'connection' was highly valued. Connection allowed them to develop an informed and shared understanding of the changes to his or her role, as well as the reassurance and confidence to embrace newchallenges, such as teaching virtually and attending to student well-being." | Educational leaders and teachers within medicals schools have other responsibilities and are overstretched during the COVID-19 pandemic. Arranging for a co-facilitator to help keep track of comments and questions was helpful. Participants seemed quite open to share varied and even competing opinions. Faculty valued other forms of follow-up communication. | Virtual faculty development sessions appear promising, but still needs evaluation over time. |
| Buléon et al. | Protecting healthcare providers from COVID-19 through a large simulation training programme | August | CME | HCW;  n=1143 | Multi-professional | Europe | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Develop simulations to prepare trainees for infection control procedures | 6 procedural skills sim sessions in-situ for hand sanitizing, fitting N95 masks, donning, doffing, airway management. Each provider viewed tutorial, took turns preforming skill while others rated them using checklists, received immediate feedback, repeated until each provider passed. | Developed and trained over 10 days, no description of cost or specific materials | ND | QI; New/modified checklists and policies; Providers trained were 4x less likely to contract COVID | ND | Time constraints, small group and distancing limitations | Impossible to prepare for everything; will be a need for rapid, massive, and targeted adaptation to future health crises. Simulation is effective for training many people in new procedures. Training is critical to limit viral spread. |
| Burns & Wenger | A remotely conducted paediatric bootcamp for fourth‐year medical students | June | UME | 4th year med students;  n=6 | Pediatrics | USA | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Provide a virtual "boot camp" to medical students preparing them for residency without in-person rotations | Remote pediatric bootcamp with didactics, flipped classroom, small group activities, role-plays and case discussions delivered via Zoom. SP exercises converted to case-based discussions. Procedural training supplemented by online videos and interactive modules. | Required 32 volunteer instructors for six students over 40 sessions. | 1 | ND | All but one session (using social media and technology in medicine) received an average rating of 4.5 or higher on a 5-point Likert scale. | Time to appropriately prepare for remote sessions, particularly with procedure and exam related activities, can enhance the experience (i.e. providing students with kits/materials to practice virtually with instructors). Practice sharing audio and visual material prior to sessions allows for less technical difficulty. | Most of the pre-existing bootcamp curriculum could be adapted to remote format readily. Even for traditionally clinical in-person experiences, planned learning activities can be converted to satisfactory/enjoyable remote learning sessions. |
| Carroll et al. | Re-ACT: Remote Advanced Communication Training in a Time of Crisis | August | CME | Physicians, PAs, NPs;  n~700 | Inter-professional and Multi-disciplinary | USA | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19)  Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Adapt to online format and provide communication training | Converted in person training to 1-hour virtual format offered 3-4 days a week with live patient-actors and opportunity for participants to practice serious illness communication skills with actors. | Used Zoom, live patient-actors (paid $30 / hour), volunteer facilitators. Costs estimated to be $1 per person compared to $500 when offered live. If facilitators paid, costs increase to $4 per person. | 1; 2b | QI | Re-ACT participants felt less prepared from the training compared to those who did ACT, but did feel more prepared than before any training. Table 2 compares learning from in-person sessions versus Re-ACT on a variety of advanced communication skills. | Learning is negatively impacted, but gains are still seen compared to no intervention. | "Provided effective and well-received communication training during a time of crisis." Cost is significantly reduced and can reach more participants with the remote format, particularly if the training is championed by institutional leaders. |
| Chandra et al. | Zooming-out COVID-19: Virtual clinical experiences in an emergency medicine clerkship | June | UME | Medical students;  n=67 | Emergency Medicine | USA | University | Telehealth | Allow students to engage in patient care and practice communication skills by interacting with patients discharged from the hospital | Students video called 2 groups of discharged ED patients: those who were COVID + or those with general medical complaints. Students had a script and a checklist to guide them and were supervised remotely by a faculty preceptor. | Zoom teleconferencing app with HIPPA-compliant account; 1 faculty preceptor per student | 1 | Patients were grateful for follow up; faculty liked teaching | Students gave positive feedback – felt engaged and valued. | Not all patients answered calls – needed longer roster of patients for callbacks | "Students felt engaged and valued the help they provided to the ED during the pandemic... Patients were grateful for the follow-up." |
| Cheung et al. | Investigating effects of healthcare simulation on personal strengths and organizational impacts for healthcare workers during COVID-19 pandemic: A cross-sectional study | July | CME | Doctors, nurses, patient care assistants;  n=1415 | Inter-professional and Multi-disciplinary | Asia | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Unify and standardize hospital-wide practice and procedures to minimize contamination by and exposure to COVID-19 during high risk procedures. | 101 simulations were conducted either "in-situ" in the ED or ICU or "lab-based" for isolation and general wards. Specific personal strengths of HCW were explored (assertiveness, mental preparedness, internal locus of control and responsibility) between simulation settings. | none | 1; 2a; 2b; 3; 4a | QI | Summarized in figure 1. Both in situ and lab simulations increased personal strength measures equally. Impact of intervention across all Kirkpatrick levels: Participants highly satisfied, improved knowledge and skills, changed behaviors, clinical outcomes, and organizational practices. | Effective strategies: 1. Doctor-nurse ratio ≤ 1:5 (nurses had greater training needs; prone to stress) 2. Prioritize training for high-risk areas  3. Use parallel modes of simulation (in-situ and lab-based simulation) 4. Offer quotas for observers to maximize training capacity 5. Align with most up-to-date guidelines of infection control | Workforce can adapt in times of crisis. Simulation has shown promising evidence for infection control, enhanced skills and knowledge acquisition and personal strengths, leading to satisfactory clinical and organizational outcomes. |
| Chow et al. | The Next Pandemic: Supporting COVID-19 Frontline Doctors Through Film Discussion | Sept-ember | Mixed | Residents, non-trainee medical officers;  n=63 | Pediatrics | Asia | Academic hospital | Well-being / mental health / learner support | Educate and provide support to front line doctors in training | Film screening (e.g., documentary about SARS pandemic) followed by discussion with facilitators, limited to 12 students. Students queried about impact of film in relation to current COVID-19 pandemic (e.g., How has COVID-19 impacted on your personal life? How do you feel about the publics’ response?) | 6 faculty members, 2 facilitators for each session, Netflix, projector, 1-hour discussion per session | 1 | ND | Session appreciated by participants. Participants reflected on a variety of areas including preparedness, blame, impact on HCW and the public. | ND | Medical humanities have a role in providing education and support for HCWs in a pandemic. Session generated reflective discussion and potentially personal growth. |
| Clemmons et al. | Building Up While Shutting Down: An Academic Health System Educational Response to the COVID-19 Pandemic | August | UME | Medical students;  n=347 | N/A | USA | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Provide training on the pandemic (i.e., alternative learning experiences) during the suspension of clinical activities to support safety | A pandemic course was created focused on basic, clinical and health systems science, public health, and health equity related to COVID-19. Students completed 3 learning events and associated study per day, including a variety of media (e.g., faculty recorded lectures, narrated PowerPoints, educational videos), reading materials, and select live sessions on Zoom. Exams were done online, flexible in time and location. | Rapid development over 2 weeks. No details but appears to use readily available resources. | 1, 2a, 2b | ND | Exam 1 scores ranged from 79% - 100%. Exam 2 scores ranged from 84% - 100%. Students appreciated the monumental effort involved to create and curate educational content in such a short amount of time. High yield basic science information, and lectures related to the scientific underpinnings of the COVID-19 pandemic received the highest evaluations. | Difficult to create a curriculum with evolving and rapidly changing information. | This course integrated basic and clinical science with the larger context of health equity, physician mental health, and community response beyond the clinical environment. This offers an important opportunity to prepare well-rounded future physicians. |
| Co & Chu | Distant surgical teaching during COVID-19 - A pilot study on final year medical students | June | UME | Final (6th) year medical students;  n = 30 | General Surgery | Asia | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Implement remote learning strategies to teach basic surgical skills (e.g., knot tying) | Students (who had previously undergone in-person surgical skills training) attended an identical web-based surgical skills training. Instructor utilized two cameras - one for close-up and another for video conferencing. Students had computer set up to optimize visualization of their hands for instructor assessment with feedback. | Camera, laptop, dedicated space for lab session, training session for faculty utilizing conferencing software and technologies to optimize visualization and assessment | 1, 2b | ND | Most students indicated web-based surgical skill learning was clear and easy to follow with similar knowledge acquisition for instrumental knot tying. Comparative outcomes (in-person vs. web-based): Instrumental knot tying - 73.4% felt similar difficulty; Hand knot tying - 36.7% found web-based learning more difficult. | Positioning of close-up camera focused on instructors' hands can facilitate demonstration (making sure camera is behind instructor as to not create extra burden for students to mirror hand placement). Students in remote learning environments need to have safety issues of sharps disposal addressed | Web-based surgical training can allow for interactive sessions with immediate feedback for student acquisition of basic surgical skills. |
| Coiado et al. | How COVID-19 Transformed Problem-Based Learning at Carle Illinois College of Medicine | August | UME | Medical students | N/A | USA | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Restructure problem-based learning small group session curriculum for remote learning environments | Online Zoom platform utilized for problem-based learning. All participants shared videos, facilitating case discussion. Various virtual whiteboards were used (e.g., Zoom, Google docs) to document key aspects of the case and discussion. | AV tech required to facilitate sharing of documents with small group via screen share. | 2b | ND | Subjective comparative outcomes (in-person vs. online PBL sessions, no reported use of scales): Students generate and research learning issues in a similar degree. Student engagement is similar. | Online sessions take more time than in-person sessions, as time is needed to pause and allow adequate time for individual speakers. There is an increased risk of student distraction due to easy access of online sites. Remote structuring may lead to more passive participation. | Successful adaptive innovation from in-person to online PBL curriculum. Could be utilized as a supplement to in-person learning in the future (allowing guest speakers). |
| Collado-Boira et al. | The COVID-19 outbreak-An empirical phenomenological study on perceptions and psychosocial considerations surrounding the immediate incorporation of final-year Spanish nursing and medical students into the health system | June | UME | Final year medical and nursing students;  n=62 | Multi-professional | Europe | University | Clinical service reconfiguration | Address a critical healthcare provider shortage in Spain, to support a health system on the verge of collapse due to COVID-19, by authorizing early graduation and non-registered practice, in a controlled work situation supervised by experts | Early graduation and practice were explored using a phenomenological, qualitative approach, to understand the lived experience of final year nursing and medical students. Convenience sampling was used. A semi-structured interview was conducted. Data was analyzed to identify interrelated themes and insights. | ND | 1; 2a | Helped fulfill critical staffing shortage | Students described reaction and attitudes, notably fears (concern of getting infected, health system disorganization, lack of PPE, feeling unprepared to cope with difficult situations (e.g., end-of-life care)). | Understanding experiences of novice health professionals responding to critical workforce shortages in a pandemic is critical for future contingency planning to prevent problems in the providers' performance. | Despite the threats posed by COVID-19, students were willing to accept the government appeal due to social commitment, vocation, and professional ethics. This study will help to detect student learning deficits, which will allow universities to better optimize the curriculum in order to ensure their success in future crises. |
| Conrad et al. | Preparing for the SARS-CoV-2 pandemic: creation and implementation of new recommendations | July | CME | Consultants, interns, and nurses | Anes-thesiology | Europe | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Develop simulation-based training sessions for anesthesia procedures | Comprehensive in-situ training sessions and new posters (figure 1) were developed and deployed with new standardized operating procedures for induction / endotracheal intubation / difficult airways with appropriate PPE. | Requires high level of staffing and time. | 4a | Policy change, kits, protocols; lots of QI | Transfer of new procedures into organizational practice; determined need for separate induction / extubation and intraoperative teams to minimize exposure; to date no COVID transmission has occurred. | Helpful to have relationship with their infection control department. | Performing extensive simulation trainings is beneficial. The success of implementation depends on staff acceptance. |
| Daly Guris et al. | Just-in-Time Simulation to Guide Workflow Design for Coronavirus Disease 2019 Difficult Airway Management | May | CME | ICU doctors, nurses, respiratory therapists;  n=4 | Multi-professional | USA | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Design simulation training for treating patients with COVID-19 | Tabletop and in situ simulations: exercises increased in complexity, progressing to intubation wearing PPE, with activation of the difficult airway team (Appendix A) | none | ND | QI: Identification of potential patient care and system failure points in managing the unanticipated difficult airway. | Key points for system improvement were identified through the difficult airway simulation debrief. Clinical management of an actual COVID-19 patient with difficult airway demonstrated very similar success and anticipated failure points. | See Table 1. Communication was difficult due to noise of PAPR. Led to creation of patient-specific airway contingency planning bundle. | "We suggest a framework of systems-based process improvements in preparing for situations where the risk of failure is incredibly high to both patients and clinicians alike." |
| Day et al. | Virtual Interviews for Surgical Training Program Applicants During COVID-19: Lessons Learned and Recommendations | August | GME | Fellows | Surgical oncology | USA | Academic hospital | Interviews (selection to residency) | Develop program to interview trainees virtually | Surgical fellowship interviews were conducted in an on-line environment with faculty and current fellows support and involvement. Pre-interview day modified from typical dinner / drinks. On interview day, applicants moved from room to room on Web X platform, while interviewers stayed in the same physical room. | Web X | 1 | ND | Pre-interview group activities: current fellows 8.33/10, applicants 8.86/10. Interviews: interviewers 8.3/10, applicants 9.2/10. No applicant preferred virtual interviews to in-person interviews, but several stated they would not have a preference given a choice." | 2 interviewers interviewing together in the same room can present social distancing challenges; important to involve stakeholders | "Careful attention to the challenges and opportunities of virtual interviews, including those in the technology, process flow, interviewer and team safety communication, interpersonal, and social domains, can result in rapid implementation of a successful virtual interview experience" |
| Dennis et al. | Knowing Your Team: Rapid Assessment of Residents and Fellows for Effective Horizontal Care Delivery in Emergency Events | June | GME | Residents and fellows;  n=1053 | Multi-disciplinary | USA | National organization | Clinical service reconfiguration | Design a categorization schema (Table 1) of patient care skill sets to efficiently facilitate *horizontal care delivery* (a comprehensive, institution-wide approach to mobilize the existing trainee workforce to meet immediate needs) | Residents and fellows were broadly categorized by core specialty area and by clinical skill level to aid in horizontal deployment. This was implemented locally at Vanderbilt University Medical Center and disseminated nationally in the form of the COVID Staffing Project - a multi-institutional collaborative to implement the categorization schema across various GME supported programs. | Trainee Pandemic Role Allocation Tool (TPRAT) - Downloadable tool which automated the organization of trainee into COVID-19 clinical roles based on their specialty and year of training | ND | QI / creation of staffing call schedule. At least 2 other institutions adapted the original model. Several changes to TPRAT have been made based on received feedback. | This model for horizontal deployment of trainees during a variety of emergency situations was acceptable during the COVID-19 pandemic at 1 institution. With multi-institutional input, the instrument was refined and developed into a COVID-19 specific tool (the TPRAT) for categorizing trainee specialties, with broad interest nationally. | "The categorization scheme broadly classifies residents and fellows into only 4 categories and may not reflect the exact needs of a specific disaster response. For example, the relative lack of emphasis on surgical services during a COVID-19 pandemic response plan would not align with needs following a mass shooting, and thus each disaster may require customization." | Trainees should always be in the most relevant educational and clinical roles possible, with the goal of maximizing learning and contribution during a disasters. This classification scheme for residents and fellows, developed initially for one large institution, was disseminated nationally and further refined during the COVID-19 pandemic. The deployment tool appears feasible and widely acceptable and may be scalable to institutions of varying sizes. |
| Dharamsi et al. | Enhancing departmental preparedness for COVID-19 using rapid-cycle in-situ simulation | June | CME | Care providers;  n=36 participated, 20 observed | Emergency Medicine | Canada | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Develop a rapid-cycle in-situ simulation program facilitating identification and resolution of systems-based safety threats | In-situ simulation involving a possible COVID-19 case in respiratory failure, using a mannequin modified to aerosolize phosphorescent secretions, followed by 15-min debriefing. One session / week conducted with staff on shift. | Modified mannequin, phosphorescent moulage, simulation training team (three physician simulationists, a simulation education specialist, nurse educators and managers) | 1; 4a. | QI (identified safety threats and iterated solutions), departmental policy change | 97% of participants agreed that the simulation was relevant to their practice, and 94% felt more prepared to care for a potential case of COVID-19. Safety threats addressed. | Repeat iterations allowed for quick addressing of issues with PPE and other logistical challenges of caring for COVID-19 patients. | "Rapid-cycle in-situ simulation program provides opportunities to identify and address issues in caring for patients with possible COVID-19 in time-sensitive fashion." |
| Díaz-Guio et al. | Cognitive load and performance of health care professionals in donning and doffing PPE before and after a simulation-based educational intervention and its implications during the COVID-19 pandemic for biosafety | June | CME | Physicians, nurses, respiratory therapists n=61 | Multi-professional and Multi-disciplinary | South America | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Create simulations for donning and doffing PPE aimed at minimizing provider cognitive load after training | A 2-scenario in-situ simulation for donning and doffing PPE in the ED and ICU was created. Assessment of cognitive load was conducted using a 9-point Paas scale, and a checklist was used to assess PPE use before and after the intervention. | ND | 2b, 3 | Reduction in cognitive load and errors | "In the post-test, 100% of participants were successful in donning the PPE and 94.8% in doffing; only 9.8% were contaminated. The mean of the cognitive load was low (4.1±1.4 points), and the performance was high (7.9±1.1)." | "…donning and doffing PPE is critical and may be changed significantly by active training with clinical simulation in terms of performance and decreased cognitive load." | "Donning and doffing of PPE generate high cognitive load, teams training in high fidelity clinical simulation minimizes the load and increases performance. We recommended assisted donning and doffing, strictly following the checklists." |
| Diaz & Dawson | Use of simulation to develop a COVID-19 resuscitation process in a pediatric emergency department | August | Mixed | Pediatric ED staff; n=66 | Emergency Medicine | USA | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Develop a COVID-19 resuscitation simulation to prepare pediatric ED staff | Immersive simulations conducted focused on the physical space, staffing and flow, personnel safety, patient safety, the value of clear closed loop communication and American Heart Association COVID-19 resuscitation guidelines. Deliberate practice with facilitated feedback and reflection on performance. | 14 hours of training simulations | 2a; 2b | System testing and process improvements | "The feedback is universal increased comfort with our new space, increased understanding of needed infection prevention and control, measures surrounding COVID-19 resuscitations, improved under- standing of AHA COVID-19 recommendations, and increased confidence in resuscitating a COVID-19 pediatric patient." | "Simulation-based education optimizes the efficiency of learning at the individual and team levels by guiding participants through goal-oriented reflections in safe, encouraging, collaborative environments. Simulation may help decrease cognitive load. Simulation may mitigate errors by increasing individual and team comfort, performance and confidence." | Simulation allowed us to understand barriers within our current space and helped us develop and refine a new process that would allow us to effectively resuscitate pediatric COVID-19 patients while minimizing personnel risks. And we used simulation to educate staff about our new space, processes, and workflows. |
| Domen et al. | The APPCN multisite didactic initiative: Development, benefits, and challenges | July | Mixed | Neuropsychology faculty, fellows, students;  n=521-715 | Neuro-psychology | Inter-national | National organization of postdoctoral programs in neuro-psychology | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Provide didactic activities to trainees of member programs potentially having difficulty providing normal training activities and facilitate a sense of community during a time of social isolation. | A multi-site didactic curriculum was developed and implemented. Synchronous sessions were delivered live on Zoom. A calendar of live events was created and posted. Materials and resources were placed in an online repository for asynchronous learning. A post implementation electronic survey was initiated to assess the program. | Zoom enterprise subscription necessary to accommodate large number of learners; Calendar on Microsoft Teams; Box used as repository for didactic materials | 1; 2b | Anxiety and stress during the pandemic were assessed along with community sense by participating in the MDI | 79% endorsed that participation in MDI activities was beneficial. Table 3 (increased knowledge, increased sense of community, reduced isolation and anxiety). | Barriers to participation included not having time, difficulty accessing didactic information, and not knowing about the MDI. Trainees at nonparticipating sites reported greater anxiety than trainees at participating sites. | A multi-site didactics initiative can be planned and implemented at short notice. Well received by trainees and gives a sense of community. Facilitates learning, particularly in smaller programs. |
| Dow et al. | GP Live'- recorded General Practice consultations as a learning tool for junior medical students faced with the COVID-19 pandemic restrictions | August | UME | 1st year medical students;  n=230 | Internal medicine | Europe | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Deliver authentic GP consultations to medical students while there are restrictions on face-to-face contact | Real GP consultations recorded by GP with patient consent. Range of recordings selected for variety. Recording viewed by students in small group sessions (max 9) with GP tutor to facilitate discussion. | iPad + free standing microphone for recording, Panopto Video Platform, secure university server, team to review and make final selection of recordings, GP tutor per every 9 students | 1; 2a; 2b | ND | 93% either agree or strongly agree that is was a valuable learning experience. Student focus groups revealed changes in attitudes and learning - “applied learning; progression of skills; realistic medicine; approach to complexity and appreciation for GPs adaptability” | Issues with sound quality due to microphone positioning were main negative | Using technology can help us teach, particularly now during pandemic. Advise others to try recording GP consultations. |
| Dubé et al. | COVID-19 pandemic preparation: using simulation for systems-based learning to prepare the largest healthcare workforce and system in Canada | August | CME | Healthcare providers;  n~30,000 | Multi-professional and Multi-disciplinary | Canada | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Use a centralized simulation response team to address simulation needs across a significant geographic area | Alberta Health Service's eSIM COVID-19 response team developed a robust simulation curriculum and operationalized a coordinated response to simulation needs. Curriculum included simulation scenarios, prebriefing scripts, debriefing tools, cognitive aids, “how-to” guides and shared webinars. Three methods were used surge planning and tabletop debriefing; process walkthrough and environmental scans; rapid cycle simulation and debriefing. | 10 days to develop simulations. Team mobilized over 5 weeks, organized simulation request intake system, developed training materials; no description of cost | 4a | AHS system policy/procedure change based on provincial outcomes | Well over 2500 systems issues have been proactively identified and mitigated through > 400 simulation sessions. Nine themes deemed highest frequency and highest impact noted across province - listed in table 3. | Centralized approach beneficial | "Not all health authorities have opportunities to coordinate or operationally support a centralized team; we recommend the explicit effort of simulation programs to align with other programs in meaningful ways to analyze and share emerging data in real-time to support validation for broader sharing and scalability when possible." |
| Duggan et al. | Staying Afloat in the COVID-19 Storm: GERIAtrics Fellows Learning Online And Together (GERI-A-FLOAT) | July | GME | Geriatric fellows | Internal Medicine | USA | Collaboration of geriatric fellows | Pivot to online learning  (synchronous) | Utilize a virtual platform to teach about geriatric medicine | "GERI-A-FLOAT is a weekly, 1-hour educational series utilizing a virtual platform (Zoom) to deepen knowledge of geriatric medicine and bring together fellows from across the country for networking." Uses a variety of instructional methods: flipped classroom, interactive lectures, workshops, and smaller breakout discussions. | ND | 1; 2a | ND | "Although survey response rates were low…sessions were rated highly, and 100% of respondents noted intent to change resulting from the session" | Twitter ideal for widespread collaboration; weekly videoconferences facilitate inter-institutional collaborations; mastering Zoom is feasible; low administrative burden and high impact of crowdsourcing education; practical platform for virtual posters. | "GERI-A-FLOAT was well received by participants, expanding fellows’ clinical exposure and learning while lifting some of the burden from educators to urgently design de novo curricula related to caring for vulnerable adults during the pandemic." |
| Durfee et al. | Medical Student Education Roadblock Due to COVID-19: Virtual Radiology Core Clerkship to the Rescue | July | UME | Clinical medical students; n=111 | Radiology | USA | Academic hospitals | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Design a virtual radiology core clerkship to allow continued learning during the cessation of clinical activities | 4-week virtual Radiology Core Clerkship based on Alliance of Medical Student Educators in Radiology (AMSER). Included 19 Aquifer Modules, didactics via Zoom, and two online exams. 12 virtual homerooms formed (8-10 students each) with one flipped classroom workshop per day and second session focused on unknown case conference. | Large number of dedicated faculty (facilitation of a total of 432 small group sessions + didactics). Administrative support for scheduling of multiple sessions and coordination. | 1; 2b | ND | 84% rated course as excellent. 95% rated structural organization excellent or good and felt the content enabled them to master core knowledge in radiology. Major strengths were the small group sessions, quality of teaching, and cohesive content with clinical relevance. Final Exam scores were similar to in-person clerkship. | Speaker notes for small group sessions allowed uniform coverage of content across many facilitators. Providing continuity by assigning consistent faculty/point people for small group sessions provides a sense of community for students. Shortening lectures to 1 hour may help facilitate student retention of learning material. | Successful endeavor, providing an opportunity for students to complete a graduation requirement and, per performance on final exam, achieved appropriate mastery of learning material when compared to previous results from in-person clerkships. |
| Elledge et al. | Maxillofacial education in the time of COVID-19: the West Midlands experience | July | GME | Maxillo-facial surgery trainees;  n=15 | Oral maxillo-facial surgery | Europe | Collaboration of maxillofacial surgeons | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Implement a robust online learning program with built in quality assurance from trainer and trainee feedback | Weekly webinars by Zoom on topics related to maxillofacial surgery. Polling by Kahoot or Socrative by Master Connect. Surveys and focus groups used for feedback | ND | 1; 2b | ND | 93% - 97% positive responses regarding content and trainer delivery. Self-reported learning improvement across all program content. | Key themes included pragmatics of delivering online education, issues surrounding trainer interactivity in the virtual world, and a desire for case-based content and pre-learning of information (the “flipped classroom”). | A weekly webinar is well received and generated themes from focus groups that will inform future programs |
| Eusuf et al. | Maintaining education and professional development for anesthesia trainees during the COVID-19 pandemic: the Self-isolAting Virtual Education (SAVEd) project | August | GME | Anesthesia trainees | Anes-thesiology | Europe | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Ensure continued education of anesthesia trainees in self-isolation | The Self-isolAting Virtual Education (SAVEd) project was created by self-isolating anesthesia trainees. Consisted of 80 pre-recorded and 24 live tutorials on Zoom. Resources were promoted through e-mail, social media, and by sharing resources with other deaneries. Impact was assessed by usage statistics on social media. | None reported apart from live videoconferencing by zoom. | 1; 2b | Usage statistics on social media and websites. | Median scores for quality of content, presentation of material and usefulness compared with traditional tutorials of 5, 5, and 5. MCQ scores were higher post-tutorial than pre-tutorial in sessions where they were administered. | Benefits include less time spent travelling and the ability to access learning more flexibly. Disadvantages included the loss of social contact between trainees and less interaction between attendees and facilitators. | Self-isolating trainees project for virtual education was well received and improved knowledge in anesthesia trainees |
| Evans et al. | Use of whole slide imaging (WSI) for distance teaching | July | GME | Pathology residents;  n=15 | Pathology | Inter-national | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Provide distance teaching in pathology and address practicalities of setting up remote teaching | Virtual teaching using a digitalized slide set, image repository sharing, and videoconferencing was conducted by pathologists in Canada for trainees in Jamaica. Each teaching session consists of 5-7 cases grouped by subspecialty. Residents download the slides and discuss with the teachers as a group; The impact was evaluated by survey. | Zoom, Google hangouts, Microsoft Teams. File sharing and pathpresenter (can limit file sizes). | 1 | ND | Teachers felt that teaching was not hampered by the ’virtual’ engagement and supported the virtual teaching. Technical issues were dealt with iteratively. The residents were very supportive and enthusiastic in embracing this mode of teaching, though noted limitations (Table 1). | Technical issues surmounted by iteration and by choosing alternative devices/technology | Virtual digitalized learning using Whole slide imaging in pathology is here to stay. |
| Favier et al. | Percutaneous tracheostomy simulation training for ENT physicians in the treatment of COVID-19-positive patients | June | CME | ENT physicians n=14 | Oto-laryngology (ENT) | Europe | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Provide training for ENT physicians in the performance of percutaneous tracheostomy in COVID-19 patients to free up ICU providers | 3-hour module (Figure 1), with several simulation scenarios of increasing difficulty. Consists of briefing video, familiarization with tracheostomy kits, practice on low-tech simulator, PPE donning, completion of high-fidelity mannequin scenarios, debriefing and PPE doffing | Uses a high-tech SimMan mannequin and a low-tech procedural simulator. | 1; 2a; 2b | ND | Learning assessed by checklist, errors identified; Appendix 2 contains learner reaction, changes in confidence and learning outcomes by self-assessment and faculty assessor (with entrustment designations) | Found that anatomy in mannequins was poor substitute to real patient, so introduced low fidelity "pre-training step"; found that groups who experienced low-tech sim first had fewer procedural errors/complications. | The training developed in this paper "seems suited for training ENT physicians." |
| Flotte et al. | Accelerated Graduation and the Deployment of New Physicians During the COVID-19 Pandemic | June | UME | 4th year medical students;  n=57 | N/A | USA | University | Clinical service re-configuration | Supplement the healthcare work force in the COVID-19 pandemic by allowing early graduation and limited-licensing to practice as physicians | A review board was convened to assess whether final year medical students had satisfied the program requirements and competencies needed to complete the MD qualification. Early graduation was conducted via an online platform. Students were offered limited-licensing as physicians for 90 days on a completely voluntary basis in order to assist in the COVID-19 response. | ND | 1; 4b | ND | Thus far, very positive experiences have been reported back regarding the limited licensing of these early graduates. The assistance of these early graduates has allowed for the care of a high volume of patients with rapid turnover, despite the increased acuity. The graduates themselves have found the experience gratifying whilst gaining valuable perspectives on the effects of the pandemic of medical practice. | ND | "Successfully graduated 4th year students early and deployed these graduates to patient care teams to address the surge in COVID-19 patients. These newly graduated physicians were able to make immediate positive impact on patient care, whilst decreasing the workload for residents and faculty physicians." |
| Gallardo et al. | Home Program for Acquisition and Maintenance of Microsurgical Skills During the Coronavirus Disease 2019 Outbreak | July | GME | Neuro-surgery residents; n=5 | Neuro-surgery | South America | Academic hospital | Other; home-based learning | Introduce a model of training for acquiring and maintaining microsurgical skills at home | Training skill program for training at home using low cost affordable materials including a smart phone, a shoe box, and a set of surgical instruments. Training exercises performed once a day, 3 times a week, for 4 weeks with the dominant and non-dominant hand. Skills evaluation conducted via video. | Affordable materials, smart phone. | 1; 2b | ND | Significant improvement in performance with the dominant and the non-dominant hand, pre-post. All participants were satisfied or very satisfied with the learning objectives, material availability, exercises performed, flexibility, and the training overall. | ND | A microsurgical training program at home using low cost materials is feasible and effective in improving skills and satisfaction. |
| Garg et al. | Rapid transition of a preclinical health systems science and social justice course to remote learning in the time of coronavirus | August | UME | 1st year medical students;  n =155 | N/A | USA | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Transition a 3-week health systems science and social justice course online due to cessation of in-person teaching | Health systems science course consisting of asynchronous self-directed learning modules and synchronous, interactive didactic sessions. New content was developed to reflect systemic issues highlighted by the COVID-19 pandemic. Closed-book, short essay exam given online at end of course. | Technology team executed time-intensive technology testing, including meetings with each faculty member prior to sessions to troubleshoot accordingly. Technology availability had to be ensured for both faculty and students for successful implementation. | 1; 2b | ND | Final exam essay performance similar to prior years. Mixed reviews of independent learning modules, request for more engagement with faculty. Satisfaction improved over prior years (3.6/5 rating). | Chat function allowed for the sharing of related references and knowledge between students, enhancing engagement with learning material. Students can be encouraged to work more with others. Topics of social justice require extra support for both students and faculty in order to fully explore in-depth and emotional topics in a safe learning environment. | New multimodal methods implemented for the education of students in topics of social justice for remote learning was successful and also was time efficient. |
| Geha & Dhaliwal | Pilot virtual clerkship curriculum during the COVID-19 pandemic: Podcasts, peers and problem-solving | May | UME | Clerkship medical students;  n=6 | Internal Medicine | USA | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Convert in-person clerkship experiences to remote learning experiences mid-rotation | Twice-daily interactive remote sessions were implemented with pre-assigned medical podcasts and worksheets for students to complete. Students submitted diagnostic schema and assessments for 11 assigned cases, 2 of which required student collaboration. Oral presentations were submitted for 3 cases with feedback. 30-60 minute "rounds" were held each morning. | Increased faculty time to gain familiarity with technology and to set up learning communities | 1; 2b | ND | Satisfaction high with drafting schemas (5.0), writing diagnostic assessments (4.83), oral presentations (4.83), and podcasts (5.0); case conferences were rated lower (4.0). Most students reported positive impressions of the virtual clerkship, including increased feedback from faculty on presentations, better co-learning among students, and satisfactory knowledge. | Increased faculty time will be needed in order to foster a remote learning community, requiring recruitment of additional faculty. Shared schedules, collaborations, and video participation were essential for community building. | Engagement of peers, patients, and teachers in a virtual learning environment can provide students with communication skill sets required of physicians. |
| Gomez et al. | Innovation Born in Isolation: Rapid Transformation of an In-Person Medical Student Radiology Elective to a Remote Learning Experience During the COVID-19 Pandemic | June | UME | 2nd, 3rd and 4th year medical students;  n=116 | Radiology | USA | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Adapt in-person diagnostic radiology elective to entirely online learning experience during pause in clinical rotations | 3-week remote diagnostic radiology elective with synchronous and asynchronous didactics and interactive case review workshops using secure picture archiving communication system (PACS). Learner engagement promoted through Nearpod interactive polling, Microsoft Forms, quiz-bowls, Jeopardy sessions, journal club discussion board, required assignments and online quizzes for formative assessment. Open-book online summative assessment. | Zoom; Faculty tutorials on utilizing Zoom videoconferencing; Faculty training sessions for testing of software. VPNs, Pacsbin (HIPAA compliant collection of images), Nearpod platform, Microsoft Teams, Blackboard. | 1; 2b | ND | 100% passed the final exam. Positive reviews of online elective (strengths: Pacsbin workshops, interactive resident-led case sessions). Faculty comfortable with remote teaching and most agree or strongly agree that they have tools/resources necessary for conversion of lecture material to video format. Faculty pleased with flexibility of schedule and ability to work from home. | In-person didactics should be limited. Pre and post formative assessments for lecture material may help long-term retention of material. Enhanced utilization of audience response system, smaller class size, and access to computers with cameras may be helpful to promote a more positive learning environment. | Implementation of remote course shows that with the proper tools, interactive and engaging teaching is achievable even without in-person teaching. |
| Goncalves et al. | COVID-19: UCT-Africa Virtual ENT transcends academic silos through videoconferencing academic meetings and ward rounds | June | Mixed | Medical officers, registrars, fellows and consultants;  n=175 | Oto-laryngology | Africa | Collaboration of oto-laryngology (ENT) surgeons | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Cut across academic silos, promote institutional collaboration, and maintain educational goals | Academic presentations and academic ward rounds hosted on Zoom made open access to all ENT departments in Africa. Recorded versions of sessions also made available. | Zoom | 1 | ND | Positive learner reactions: 97% reported learning on virtual platform beneficial, 87% would like to contribute material, 67% felt virtual platforms could replace physical meetings, 97% agreed platform was sustainable post pandemic | ND | Ways in which scientific learning and networking occurs may change drastically in long term and there are opportunities for cross institutional collaboration. |
| Gulati et al. | Instagram for peer teaching: opportunity and challenge | August | UME | Medical students; n= >123 | N/A | Europe | University | Assessment | Support students while clinical placement suspended | Two 4th year medical students created "Instagram Stories", a series of multiple-choice questions (MCQs) or daily quizzes on a variety of generalist topics posted to Instagram. Each MCQ consisted of a short clinical vignetter and 4 answer options with explanations provided. > 300 questions posted over 3 months. | Instagram | 1 | ND | Respondents found project relevant to learning: ‘helped to consolidate learning’, ‘question bank was extremely relevant and thought-provoking.’ | Longer posts had substantially less engagement; the ‘quiz function’ was only available for 24 hours; and information on the platform may lack accuracy, particularly with a peer-to-peer approach. Incorporated ethnicity and health MCQs that were well received. | "Instagram is an underutilized platform for delivering medical education and is particularly well-suited for providing MCQs for revision purposes. The peer-to- peer approach allowed them to gain teaching experience early on in their career and made learning relevant" |
| Gupta et al. | Innovative anatomy assessment methods in COVID-19 pandemic: Statistical observations and students’ viewpoints | July | UME | 1st year medical students;  n=250 | Anatomy | Asia | University | Assessment | Compare 3 different assessment methods, to create a standard operating procedure for gross anatomy assessment | Students given the option to take their assessment via Viz telephonic interview, WhatsApp video call, or Zoom. 10 questions from a common pool used by each examiner. Specimens and AV carefully arranged. Assessment took 15 minutes for each student. | Viz, WhatsApp, Zoom | 2b | ND | The interview platform used by students for the anatomy examination had no significant impact on obtained scores. Students preferred Viz telephonic app to video based platforms. | Need a common set of questions to eliminate interviewer bias, choice of application was impacted by access to internet | Assessors and students both need to adapt to paradigm changes. Student feedback will tailor the assessment tool by refining validity, consistency, reliability and interaction dynamics of assessment designs. |
| Hannon et al. | An objective structured clinical examination: From examination room to Zoom breakout room | May | UME | Clerkship medical students; n=49 | N/A | USA | Academic hospital | Assessment | Evaluate if virtual OSCEs could be effective | Remote OSCE administered on Zoom. Assessed history taking, communication skills, clinical reasoning, clinical testing and documentation. PE maneuvers were verbalized but could not be adequately assessed. 1 OSCE per day and 4-6 students per round. Students received training prior to the OSCE with regards to technology. | Zoom, Qualtrics, SPs; cost savings due to not using clinical skills center or staff | 1 | ND | Students felt the narrative physical examination flow was awkward and 53% of students thought the remote OSCE was not as good as in-person but adequate for assessing clinical skills. Students and SPs appreciated the OSCE. | Hard to assess the PE, transitioned from must pass to must complete | Virtual OSCEs were good at assessing hx, communication and clinical reasoning, but hard to assess PE. |
| Hodgson & Hagan | Medical education adaptations during a pandemic: Transitioning to virtual student support | April | UME | Medical students | N/A | Europe | University | Well-being / mental health / learner support | Provide pastoral care in a non-face-to face, socially distanced manner, to assist students struggling with social isolation / coping with uncertainty | Personal tutors providing pastoral care to reduce social isolation and anxiety. Tutors connected with students in their tutor group via Microsoft Teams on 1:1 video calls and via the group chat function. | Microsoft Teams, personal tutors, 4G smartphone or laptop, internet connectivity | 1 | ND | Well received by students and faculty; Video calls better received than audio; People enjoyed the group chat | Provided relief - seeing people valued; some students limited by poor internet connectivity or lack of access to computer/smartphone. Hardship funds available. | Predict increasing use of virtual student support. |
| Huang et al. | Primary Care Mock Codes During a Pandemic: Interprofessional Team-Based Emergency Education While Maintaining Social Distance | May | CME | Medical assistants, nurses, physicians, NPs, phlebotomists n=72 | Pediatrics | USA | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Educate staff about medical emergencies while practicing social distancing | Virtual interprofessional mock codes conducted. 1 facilitator and 5 participants per 35-minute session. Material emailed in advance. Team collaborates via videoconference to manage pediatric emergency (e.g., a seizure), assessing the child, reviewing protocols, and assigning team roles. Followed by debrief. | ND | 1, 2b | ND | 96.4% agreed met learning objectives, 97.3% liked the virtual learning opportunity, 97.3% reported two key learning points. | Smaller group training improves participation by all team members. | Simulated pediatric emergencies in a virtual format were feasible and met the intended learning objectives. |
| Huffman et al. | Fellows Front and Center: Tele-Training and Telehealth | May | GME | Fellows;  n=101 | Pediatrics | USA | Academic hospital | Telehealth | Train and supervise trainees using telehealth | Fellow conducted telehealth visits with faculty observing. Used pre-brief for coordination, as well as de-brief sessions post-encounter. | Telehealth platform | 1 | ND | Total number of patient contacts maintained. Pros: 1. more observational supervision 2. real time confidential feedback; 3 adaptability skills. Faculty thought there were disadvantages (e.g., lost autonomy, heightened scrutiny), fellows did not. Fellows found being able to see patient in their home environment advantageous. | Multiparty functionality on telehealth platform was an issue | Continue telehealth in clinical care and training |
| Iqbal et al. | Telegram as a Tool to Supplement Online Medical Education During COVID-19 Crisis | June | UME | Medical students;  n=203 | N/A | Middle East | University | Other | Explore the impact of Telegram, a cloud-based messaging and file sharing application, on medical student education | Telegram is a free, cloud-based messaging application capable of being used on both smartphones and desktops (www.telegram.com). It allows users to create groups and channels, facilitating the sharing of files of multiple formats, including PowerPoint presentations, audios/videos, PDFs, and Word documents. | Telegram application | 1 | ND | Benefits include ease of access to educational resources; unlimited sharing capacity (no limits on group size or file size); easy communication with colleagues and class leaders; engagement with teachers promotes wellbeing; security of messages. | Downsides: can be distracting, interface complex to use, information overload. Resource sharing was found to be valuable. | Telegram offers more functionality and fewer drawbacks than other Apps and allows users to take responsibility for their own learning. |
| Jack et al. | Live-Streaming Surgery for Medical Student Education - Educational Solutions in Neurosurgery During the COVID-19 Pandemic | July | Mixed | Clinical medical students and residents; n=6 | Neuro-surgery | USA | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Leverage technology to ensure ongoing surgical education when in-person activities are limited | Livestreaming of neurosurgical procedures conducted using secure Zoom. Multiple video channels used, including operation views, microscope views, and neuronavigational views. Audio was transmitted via Bluetooth headset (worn by primary neurosurgeon) or speaker (for access to entire OR team) for real-time 2-way communication between learners and surgical team. | Technologic resources include: Laptop for transmission of audio/video, HDMI splitter to receive multiple video inputs, integrated camera in overhead surgical light, GoPro, Bluetooth speaker or headset. Personnel to switch screen views, training in utilization/setup | 1; 2b | ND | Survey respondents felt that the overall picture quality of live-streamed procedures was good (in-light camera) or exceptional (microscopic) with no significant delays that impacted their learning. They noted improved knowledge in neuroanatomy after viewing. Communication/interaction with surgical team was noted as exceptional | Quality of audio/video is dependent on internet speed and bandwidth for both host and viewer, advantage of direct ethernet connection. In-light camera more valuable as it was placed with appropriate level of zoom to display surgical field, in contrast to the GoPro Hero5 (limited zooming capability limits visualization). Excess cords to facilitate livestreaming may pose safety hazard. | A method of livestreaming OR cases via Zoom while allowing communication between viewers and surgeons can enhance the remote learning experience of both clinical medical students and residents. |
| Jarry Trujillo et al. | Surgical training during COVID-19: a validated solution to keep on practicing | August | GME | Surgical trainees;  n=24 surgical skills; n=610 COVID competencies | Multi-professional | South America | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (asynchronous) | Develop a validated technology-based methodology for remote skill training | A web-based mobile platform (LAAP) to train laparoscopic surgeons remotely: LAPP connects trainees to an online network of certified tutors. Trainees watch an instructional video, practice, then upload a video of exercise. Tutors provide personalized feedback. Content includes laparoscopy and other procedures, COVID-related skills (intubation, PPE, mechanical ventilation, prone positioning) | LAAP network was developed prior to pandemic and modified | 2b | Health ministry has adapted the platform | Over 240 sessions assessed, and 711 feedbacks on surgical skills given. For COVID related competencies, >796 sessions assessed and >3700 feedbacks | The easy scalability means methodologies like this will soon become part of our lives. The system not only removes the need for on-site trainers but also provides much convenience and safety to both instructors and trainees. | This remote surgical teaching system can help residents keep on training during lockdown, supporting them with hundreds of expert feedbacks. |
| Jones et al. | Interprofessional education during the COVID-19 pandemic: finding the good in a bad situation | August | UME | Students of health professional programs;  n=654 | Inter-professional | USA | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Convert a large foundational interprofessional course to an online learning environment and evaluate impact on interprofessional competencies | 25 online groups with 30 interprofessional students each + 1 facilitator enrolled into online sessions. Four discussion boards mirroring in-person content were created for each group with an additional COVID-19 discussion board for application of knowledge of interprofessional care to current scenarios. All except one discussion board (Team Final Presentation) were worked on by each individual asynchronously. | Online learning management system available for all students across different institutions. Discussion board platform and 12 facilitators to monitor online discussion. | 1 | ND | Majority (69.2%) indicated preference for in-person courses. Two formats roughly equivalent in content delivery, involvement, learning. Students felt slightly more connected in the online course. Positives: flexible schedule, self-pacing, time for reflection, engagement. Negatives: lack of face-to-face interaction, less connectivity, communication challenges, unclear expectations, lack of feedback | More time needs to be allocated to review pedagogy for online teaching, learning, and best practices. Enhanced communication of course requirements in a stressful time and also across a student body from various institutions was difficult. | Interprofessional learning with, from, and about health profession students can take place through an online format and students can meet core competencies of IPE in this format. |
| Joseph et al. | COVID-19 Pandemic-Medical Education Adaptations: the Power of Students, Staff and Technology | July | UME | Medical students;  n=200 | N/A | Europe | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Transition a predominantly in-person curriculum to online at one of the newest UK medical schools | Integrated, systems-based curriculum with early clinical contact delivered via multiple new modalities. Resources placed on learning management platform. Delivery included podcasts, webinars, narrated presentations, small group tutorials, asynchronous formative assessments, and synchronous large group feedback. Facilitated by collaboration on resources with other UK schools. | Canvas, Zoom, BigBlueButton, and Microsoft teams all available to staff members. Required adoption of unfamiliar technologies by faculty. | 1 | ND | Students prefer variety of teaching modalities, smaller interactive groups, shorter lessons (20-40 minutes). | Lab work and clinical skills teaching was not able to be effectively taught by online modality. Security of summative evaluations was challenging. | The power of technology has been fully embraced to continue providing medical education in the time of crisis. However, preclinical medicine cannot be satisfactorily delivered exclusively online in the long term. |
| Jumat et al. | From Trial to Implementation, Bringing Team-Based Learning Online-Duke-NUS Medical School's Response to the COVID-19 Pandemic | August | UME | Preclinical medical students n=82 | N/A | Asia | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Move an entire curriculum comprised of modified TBL sessions to an online format | TBL activities were transitioned online in the Zoom platform. Students completed pre-session assignments and readiness assurance tests. Team sessions were conducted using chat box and shared online documents. In lieu of breakout rooms, a separate video conferencing session or instant messaging platform was employed based on team preferences to manage side conversations. Sessions close with large group discussion. | Robust administrative team (n =7) maintained online learning resources, granted appropriate access, conducted training sessions for platform use, and provided in-session technical support | 1 | ND | Students appreciated the online TBL format and found it easy to communicate with their peers. | Creating breakout rooms for 82 students in 13 teams in Zoom was cumbersome. Access to reliable internet network or internet-enabled devices was a major obstacle for all participants. Technological literacy ability was also a challenge, requiring support from a dedicated administrative team. | The preparedness of the educational leadership and dynamic work ethic of the administrative team allowed for the successful deployment of online TBL curriculum. |
| Juprasert et al. | Restructuring of a General Surgery Residency Program in an Epicenter of the Coronavirus Disease 2019 Pandemic: Lessons From New York City | July | GME | Surgical residents | General Surgery | USA | Academic hospital | Clinical service reconfiguration | Reassign general surgery residents and restructure surgical services to support pandemic efforts, maintain staffing for emergency surgical care, limit infection risk, and maintain surgical education | Surgery department restructured and residents redeployed to address clinical needs in 3 phases: 1) prioritize reserve pool and limit exposure; 2) condense surgical services and implement procedure team; 3) redeploy to support ICU expansion. Resident training / education transitioned to web-based lecture series. Residents mental health and well-being were attended to (e.g., CopeNYP and conferences with Psychiatry faculty to mitigate distress). | ND | ND | Enabled staffing of additional ICU beds, created surgery capacity (Figure 4) | Many changes to the structure of services were successful and enhanced critical care capacity. Formation of the procedural team was valuable to offload ICU work. | Flexible, real-time communication was necessary between program leadership, ICU directors, and the residents. It was also vital to empower those in charge of scheduling to make decisions in the best interest of the residents without going through the normal approval process. Prompt and clear dissemination of information was essential. | As surgical volume returns, will need to strike the right balance of surgical education and optimal patient care. |
| Kesselman et al. | Endovascular simulation as a supplemental training tool during the COVID-19 national emergency | August | GME | Interventional radiology trainees;  n=6 | Radiology | USA | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Ensure endovascular procedural proficiency in context of reduced case load | Educational program consisting of didactic instruction (total 36 hours) and live procedural participation, supplemented by high fidelity endovascular simulations (~ 6 hours per trainee, limited to 3 participants at a time for social distancing). | Two VIST G5 endovascular simulation units with over 20 endovascular modules | 1 | ND | All respondents stated simulator use was helpful for their education | Simulators are expensive but worth the investment. | During national emergencies, compromises to interventional radiology education can be mitigated by use of novel educational tools such as high-fidelity endovascular simulators |
| Khalil et al. | The sudden transition to synchronized online learning during the COVID-19 pandemic in Saudi Arabia: a qualitative study exploring medical students' perspectives | August | UME | Medical students;  n = 60 | N/A | Middle East | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Explore medical student perceptions regarding the effectiveness of synchronized online learning | Virtual curriculum at Unaizah College of Medicine included lectures, case discussions, 4-box case analysis, clinical case discussions, online seminars, and dry labs (online laboratory demonstrations). This qualitative study used virtual focus groups and a discussion guide with 7 open-ended questions. Interviews were analyzed for thematic content. | ND | 1 | ND | Online learning may work better for content learning in some areas (like basic sciences) but less so for others (clinical skills). Recorded lectures allowed better understanding and mastery of content. Online sessions saved time and performance improved, associated with higher levels of contentment. Preferences for future: mixed (clinical and TBL skills felt to be better in person) | Technical insufficiency (poor internet connectivity and deficits in educators' basic computer skills) | Synchronized online classes were well-accepted by medical students, representing potential for the future of medical education. An organized and clear institution approach to online teaching and faculty mastery of technologic tools will facilitate adoption. |
| Khan & Kiani | Impact of multi-professional simulation-based training on perceptions of safety and preparedness among health workers caring for coronavirus disease 2019 patients in Pakistan | June | CME | Nurses, doctors, nursing assistants, ambulance drivers, sanitation, laundry;  n=44 | Multi-professional | Middle East | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Improve health workers’ perceived preparedness, safety, and willingness to care for COVID-19 through simulation | Simulation-based course including use of PPE, safety protocols, clinical procedures performed on patients by staff, sanitation procedures performed by sanitation staff, etc. Used mannequins, mock patients, and integrative classroom and practical sessions. | Mannequins, mock patients | 2a | ND | Figure 1 shows changes in attitudes: Participants felt more prepared to handle tasks related to the care of COVID-19 patients and felt more strongly that those who did not complete the training were not prepared to care for COVID-19 patients. Reported less fear. | Debriefing sessions invaluable | "Multi-professional simulation-based training imparted confidence and sense of preparedness among HCW." |
| Krawiec & Myers | Remote Assessment of Video-Recorded Oral Presentations Centered on a Virtual Case-Based Module: A COVID-19 Feasibility Study | June | UME | 3rd year medical students;  n=12 | Pediatrics | USA | Academic hospital | Assessment | Develop clinical skills in the absence of clinical contact using a videorecorded oral presentation assignment with formative assessment | Students videorecorded a < 10-minute oral presentation of a patient they saw on their clerkship or a virtual online case. Assessed based on rubric on patient history, PE, diagnostic test results, summary statement, assessment and plan, clinical reasoning and synthesis of information, and general aspects (organization, speaking style) | Aquifer case files | 2b | ND | Overall formative assessment scores of video-recorded oral presentations were 5 (mostly on target). Table 1 shows scores for individual components in the rubric. | Tool was not validated to use with virtual cases. | "This study demonstrated the possibility of remotely assessing oral presentation skills centered on virtual case-based modules using a patient presentation tool intended for non-virtual patients." |
| Kuo et al. | Efficacy of Vascular Virtual Medical Student Education During the COVID-19 Pandemic | Sept-ember | UME | 3rd year medical students | Vascular surgery | USA | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Create virtual electives for surgical subspecialties | Virtual Surgical Education Group (ViSEG) designed virtual electives in 8 surgical specialties, including vascular surgery. Week-long curriculum based on American College of Surgeons prerequisite competencies and USMLE content outline. 4 hours lectures daily, assigned readings of landmark vascular surgery publications, video instruction of PE and procedures. Proctored virtual skills lab offered suturing instruction with webcams for real time feedback. | Webcam, faculty mentor, skills lab materials | 1; 2b | ND | Students indicate overall positive response to course and increased interest in pursuing vascular surgery as a career. Students showed improved performance after elective with significantly improved pre / post scores. | ND | Successful remote delivery of a vascular surgery curriculum to medical students can be accomplished and may serve as a vital adjunct to traditional clerkships. |
| Lakissian et al. | In-situ simulations for COVID-19: a safety II approach towards resilient performance | July | Mixed | attendings, residents, fellows, nurses, students, respiratory therapists  n=131 | Multi-disciplinary | Middle East | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Improve the safety of patients and providers via simulation, to practice new care guidelines specific to COVID-affected patients | In-situ simulations of rapid sequence intubation and other respiratory interventions, PPE donning/doffing to prepare multidisciplinary teams and identify latent safety threats. Simulations consist of prebrief, simulation scenario and debrief, conducted with native teams. | Three different high-fidelity simulation mannequins available; no details of cost or duration of QI project as a whole. As of pub, 131 participants and 22 simulations run. | 1; 2a; 2b, 4a | QI, identification of latent safety threats | Most participants strongly agree that the simulation improved their knowledge and confidence of both clinical and efficient teamwork skills (additional file 1). Safety issues identified and solutions (Table 1). | Deliberate practice of utmost importance for rare events. Shift from safety I (what went wrong and why) to safety II (what went right) employed to further improve systems. Aim is to create teams that are better able to respond, monitor, learn and anticipate. | "Guiding healthcare professionals in attaining desired levels of comfort and preparedness, individually and in a team setting, helps them maintain and perpetuate the efficient practices performed/acquired during simulation, thus allowing them to become active and proactive." |
| Laloo et al. | Virtual surgical education for core surgical trainees in the Yorkshire deanery during the COVID-19 pandemic | Sept-ember | GME | Surgical trainees;  n=62 | General Surgery | Europe | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Promote high quality surgical education and facilitate on-going learning | Online teaching program developed for core surgical trainees. Twice weekly teaching sessions (20 total) either delivered synchronously via Zoom with interaction or pre-recorded and uploaded onto Google Classroom and YouTube for asynchronous consumption. Teaching delivered by senior surgeons and consultants. Content in accordance with Joint Committee of Surgical Training curriculum and Membership of the Royal College of Surgeons examinations. | Zoom, YouTube, Google Classroom | 1 | ND | Figures 2-4: 79% rated the series highly, 86% rated the series as useful, 93% were satisfied with the platforms used. Weekly short sessions were preferred to monthly longer sessions. | Recording attendance may improve uptake. Shorter interactive sessions can promote attention and retention. Multimedia can enhance learning. | An online teaching program for core surgical trainees is feasible and well received. |
| Lang et al. | POPCoRN One-Pagers: Educational Materials for Pediatric Providers Caring for Adults | May | CME | Pediatric providers | Pediatrics | USA | Multi-institutional collaboration | Faculty development | Provide educational materials to support pediatric providers caring for adults during the pandemic | Pediatric Overflow Planning - Contingency Response Network (POPCoRN), a multi-institutional collaboration, created an inventory of high-yield topics in the form of succinct, one-page, living documents. The one-pagers were developed by multiple individuals, then formatted for consistency, with final input from an adult hospitalist and pediatrician for content accuracy and clarity, respectively. Documents are housed on the POPCoRN website. | Committee for final overview, web repository | 1 | ND | Since the introduction to POPCoRN One-Pagers on 29th March 2020 there have been 54,841 views (which shows resource uptake). Excellent feedback has been received regarding the utility of these documents in a real-time setting. | ND | There has been excellent feedback about the utility of these 'one-pager' documents in the on-the-ground care of adults in previously pediatric predominant areas. |
| Lara et al. | Remote Assessment of Clinical Skills During COVID-19: A Virtual, High-Stakes, Summative Pediatric Objective Structured Clinical Examination | June | UME | Clerkship medical students;  n=49 | Pediatrics | USA | Academic hospital | Assessment | Develop a teleOSCE for a high-stakes summative assessment of clinical skills | TeleOSCE implemented on Zoom. All participants engaged remotely. Used established SP checklists, communication scoring tools, and faculty observation rubric. In virtual "hallway" students get a pre-brief and are given a "doorway folder". Students are then moved into the exam room with SP, faculty and administrator. Encounter lasts 22 minutes. They repeat the cycle for a total of 4 pediatric cases. | Zoom, SPs | 2b | ND | No difference in mean scores or failure rate when compared to last three years of in-person OSCEs | Could run through half as many OSCEs in a day, compared to the live version. | Remote summative teleOSCEs are feasible with similar outcomes. |
| Lawrence et al. | Building Telemedicine Capacity for Trainees During the Novel Coronavirus Outbreak: a Case Study and Lessons Learned | July | GME | Residents;  n=23 | Internal Medicine | USA | Academic hospital | Assessment | Prepare residents to work in a telemedicine environment | 5 OSCE cases adapted to a virtual visit telemedicine format. Each encounter took 10 minutes. Competencies assessed included acknowledging a medical error, recognizing and addressing patient emotions, and establishing trust. Trained SPs used a standardized evaluation tool that rated performance using a behaviorally anchored scale (not done, partially done, done). Faculty provided verbal feedback and completed an entrustment scale. | Open Notes mock electronic health record, virtual platform (unspecified), simulation center exam rooms with audio / video recording equipment and one-way mirrors for faculty observation | 1, 2b | ND | Residents expressed enthusiasm for telemedicine training but had concerns about their preparedness for telemedicine practice and the need for further competency and curricular development. Differences were seen between the in person and telemedicine encounters. | Cases and scoring rubrics were not developed for telemedicine; Digital professionalism should be incorporated into pragmatic telemedicine training. | Programs interested in building capacity among residents to perform telemedicine, particularly during the COVID-19 pandemic, can make significant impact in their trainees’ comfort and preparedness by addressing key issues in technical proficiency, history and exam skills, and communication |
| Lee I. et al. | Academic coaching of medical students during the COVID-19 pandemic | June | UME | Medical students | N/A | Asia | University | Well-being / mental health / learner support | Support students within an adapted, virtual education program | A virtual academic coaching program was created around the conceptual framework of the Master Adaptive Learner (MAL). The framework consists of 4 phases - planning, learning, assessing and adjusting. 2 academic coaches tracked and analyzed students’ performance. Interventions addressed content matters, study habits or learning strategies. Regular 30-minute meetings were scheduled with coaches for reflection and feedback. | Core teaching faculty + 2 academic coaches | 1 | ND | "Students in the program favored the proactive support. Many acknowledged that individualized goal-directed study plans and follow-up meetings kept them accountable, reflective and motivated, and guarded against the use of ineffective learning strategies." | "At times, it was important for coaches to help students reprioritize, troubleshoot and re-work study plans, as well as encouraging a deliberate holistic approach that included self-care and the maintenance of mental wellness." “Regular and short‐interval engagement with students during social isolation allows them to feel safe in reaching out for help and empowers them” | "This model of academic coaching informed by theory supports students and empowers them with the skills necessary for effective learning, adapting and thriving in a health care environment challenged by uncertainty and ambiguity." |
| Lee Y. et al. | Enforced format change to medical education webinar during the coronavirus disease 2019 pandemic | May | CME | Medical school faculty:  n=210 | N/A | Asia | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Continue faculty development offerings during pandemic to enhance teaching competencies | Regular faculty development seminars were held as interactive online webinars. Each session lasted 1 hr. with participants utilizing the chat feature. | ND | 1 | ND | Increase in attendance from face to face seminars. During first webinar: 78.5% reported technical difficulties with connection, 37% described multi-tasking, 87% strongly agreed with liking the format. Satisfaction went up with the 2nd webinar. | Technical problems (e.g., internet capacity and clarity) required troubleshooting | Webinar format for faculty development has been successfully launched with improved participation. |
| Lieberman et al. | Coping With COVID-19 | Sept-ember | UME | Clinical medical students;  n = 28 | Pathology | USA | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Implement remote 2-week clinical pathology elective to ensure continued learning during the pause in face-to-face activities | 2-week remote clinical pathology elective implemented. Focus was on teaching student’s efficient selection and interpretation of laboratory tests. Zoom was utilized for some didactic content, small group sessions, "rounds," and "sign-out". Self-study resources were provided, and reflective writing assignments were implemented. Emerging clinical laboratory information on COVID-19 incorporated. | Secure Zoom for transmitting protected health information | 1 | ND | Average rating of the course Overall rating of course 4.45-4.57/5, good to excellent. Students reported the course helped them appreciate the significance of the subject matter. Strengths included digital resources, study time, integration with clinical work, and variety of presentations. Weaknesses included fatigue with teleconferencing and density of complex subject matter. | Serving students in different time zones requires minimization of activities at the extremes of workday. Teleconferencing fatigue is a concern. Increased breaks during activities may help. | Remote learning offers in-depth instruction in laboratory medicine, exposing students to the critical role of clinical laboratory in response to emerging infections and affords flexibility for educators to response to the continuing pandemic. |
| LoSavio et al. | Rapid implementation of COVID-19 tracheostomy simulation training to increase surgeon safety and confidence | May | Mixed | Attendings, residents, operating room nurses;  n=17 | General Surgery | USA | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Determine if simulation training for tracheostomy increases procedural confidence and proper use of PPE | A simulation program to teach faculty and residents a new tracheostomy protocol with proper use of enhanced PPE in patients with COVID-19. Specifically focuses on the use of CAPR devices (Controlled Air Purifying Respirators) in conjunction with sterile gowning technique. | 5 days to develop, 2 days to teach; CAPR device, tracheostomy equipment, mannequin | 2a; 2b | ND | Significant improvement in knowledge and confidence levels (Table 1). Participants reported the session to be very helpful and increased their comfort level in surgically treating COVID-19 patients. | Consider implementation of a mobile tracheostomy team and focus early simulation training on this team. | Rapidly implemented simulation training was demonstrated to successfully increase confidence levels among resident and attending surgeons. This protocol can serve as a blueprint for any medical center being faced with the scenario of potentially having to perform tracheostomy in COVID-19 patients. |
| Maeda et al. | Experience with online lectures about endoscopic sinus surgery using a video conferencing app | July | Mixed | Residents;  n=35 | Oto-laryngology (ENT) | Asia | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Provide remote surgical education to residents and specialists | Interactive lectures delivered using Zoom, including videos for endoscopic surgery. Chat or hand-raising functions used for interaction. | Zoom | 1 | ND | 91% response rate (Table 2). Learners appreciated bi directionality (i.e. engagement), though struggled with video streaming quality. The majority would like both online and face-to-face or online only sessions in the future. | Videos can be provided in advance to download to overcome connection problems; Recommend cameras on with virtual background for privacy | Feasible to deliver interactive lectures online using Zoom |
| Malhotra et al. | Conducting orthopedic practical examination during the Covid-19 pandemic | July | GME | Residents | Orthopedics | Asia | Academic hospital | Assessment | Conduct a zero patient contact exit exam | Cases (see example figure 3) were developed in a digital format by faculty (cases presented in PowerPoint with photographs, radiographic findings, etc.). Oral exam is conducted in-person with multiple examiners and faculty present, socially distanced, but no patients, Exam consists of 1 long case and 3 short cases. | Faculty / examiner time | 1 | ND | See table 2 and figure 5a. The mean score for overall satisfaction for each question in examiner group was 4.5 while that in examinee group was 4.1. The mean total score for the examiner and examinee group was 48 and 43.4 respectively. | A similar exam could be administered entirely via Zoom. | Orthopedic residency end-of-training examinations can be successfully conducted during the COVID pandemic. |
| Mastroianni et al. | Changing our training paradigms in general surgery residency during the covid-19 outbreak | August | GME | Residents, fellows; n=62 | General Surgery | South America | Academic hospital | Clinical service reconfiguration; Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) Well-being / mental health | Outline changes in the general surgery residency program, prioritizing learner safety while maintaining quality of supervised continuous medical teaching | Multiple interventions described with minimal detail: 1) Residents placed in teams working one week on, 2 weeks off to create a reserve workforce. Residents don't participate in COVID + surgeries. 2) Resident conducted (faculty supervised) didactics via Zoom. Simulation activities continued and resident research projects accelerated due to increased time. 3) Well-being support through direct contact with psychologist and faculty - resident mentorship pairings | ND | 1 | Reduced COVID infections amongst residents | 92.5% of residents felt totally satisfied with the modification to surgical training as a result of COVID-19 | Resident feedback regarding changes is important in identifying any developing psychological health concerns as a consequence of the global crisis | This model proved to be a useful strategy in a general surgery residency program at a university hospital to deal with the outbreak training limitations focusing on resident safety and welfare. |
| Matalon et al. | Trainee and Attending Perspectives on Remote Radiology Readouts in the Era of the COVID-19 Pandemic | July | GME | Residents, fellows;  n=105 | Radiology | USA | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Implement remote radiology "read outs" to comply with social distancing | PACS workstations redistributed to empty offices and meeting rooms to facilitate remote radiology readouts. Videoconferencing and screensharing tools were used. 2 workflows: 1) synchronous review and discussion of trainee preliminary report via Microsoft Teams; 2) asynchronous review, attending edits trainee report and provides feedback later via email | HIPAA compliant Microsoft Teams, Primordial messenger, PACS stations | 1 | ND | Table 2 and 3a: "Early perceptions of remote readouts by radiology trainees and attendings was generally positive, specifically regarding the themes of social distancing, technology, and autonomy/competency, with negatively rated themes of education/feedback and atmosphere/professional relationships." | Synchronous review ideal for junior residents or complex cases. Asynchronous review ideal for senior residents and straightforward cases. Model may facilitate enhanced autonomy / graduated responsibility for senior residents. May enhance efficiency of senior residents when volume is high and case complexity low. | Remote supervision and feedback of trainee radiologists' reports is feasible, and the benefits outweigh the drawbacks. |
| McRoy et al. | Radiology Education in the Time of COVID-19: A Novel Distance Learning Workstation Experience for Residents | August | GME | PGY1 radiology residents;  n=9 | Radiology | USA | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Simulate live radiology workstation teaching and ensure adequate call-preparation | Figure 1 provides overview: A radiographic case collection was created in Pacsbin, a HIPPA compliant app that allows anonymized images from PACS to be stored in the cloud. A senior resident manager selects daily cases and puts them on Google Classroom. A senior resident teacher generates a report. Learners independently interpret images and submit their assignment. Learners then engage with near-peer teachers in a readout via Zoom and obtain feedback. | Three programs used: Zoom, Google classroom, Pacsbin | 1 | ND | Figure 7 shows results. Learners felt more prepared for call, were interested in continuing the project post-pandemic and interested in expanding to radiographic subspecialties. | Pacsbin allows for dynamic engagement with images, unlike static image repositories. It also allows multiple educators to contribute files. | "This resident run platform promotes interpretive radiology skills through case review, provides a framework for self-motivated study, and encourages peer to peer learning, all via distance learning." |
| Mohd et al. | The Preparation, Delivery and Outcome of COVID-19 Pandemic Training Program among the Emergency Healthcare Frontliners (EHFs): The Malaysian Teaching Hospital Experience | June | Mixed | Medical officers, assistant medical officers, nurses;  n=178 | Emergency medicine | Asia | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Develop training modules for emergency frontliners to care for COVID patients that are safe and prevent the spread of the disease | Immersive live simulations were developed. Pre-reading materials were provided, which included basic facts. A prebrief was conducted for each of 3 modules: donning-doffing PPE, airway management and cardiopulmonary resuscitation of suspected COVID-19 patients. Simulations proceeded according to a checklist and were followed up with a debrief. | 3 weeks of training | 1, 2a | QI | Minimal report with couple quotes that participants like the training and feel more confident. | "One of the greatest challenges during the preparation of training content was the lack of available robust scientific evidence." | Checklists are important adjuncts during resuscitation and airway management in time-constrained, resource-limited situations. Face-to-face training can still be conducted, provided strict adherence to safety principles. |
| Mohos et al. | Doctor-patient communication training with simulated patient during the coronavirus pandemic | August | UME | Medical students;  n = 86 | N/A | Europe | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Provide online communication skills training | Communication skills sessions were held on Zoom with a SP. Each student records an interaction with a SP. They then meet in a small group of 5 students with a faculty facilitator. Videos are analyzed as a group. Student provides self-reflection and faculty / peers provide evaluation/feedback. | Zoom, SPs, family physician mentors (training for both). | 1 | ND | Majority of students felt sessions met the learning objectives, were useful, and instructors were prepared (4.45, 4.06, and 4.78 out of 5, respectively). Students satisfied with organization and technical management. Several highlighted the simulated patient as a rewarding component, allowing for constructive feedback and self-reflection. | Non-verbal communication is challenging in the virtual environment. Lack of infrastructure, appropriate training, and teaching attitudes were challenges. | The implementation of the online practice was successful. However, lack of personal contact is a negative. Therefore, online formats cannot be considered a complete replacement to personal communication training but can be a supplement. |
| Molina et al. | Virtual Interviews for the Complex General Surgical Oncology Fellowship: The Dana-Farber/Partners Experience | July | GME | Fellows; n=20 | Surgical oncology | USA | Academic hospital | Interviews (selection to residency) | Develop a virtual fellowship interview process to simulate the in-person interview day | A virtual interview day was conducted using Zoom breakout rooms. Applicants began their interview day in the "main room" with a 30-minute overview by the fellowship director. Applicants and faculty were moved to a "hallway" and subsequently to breakout "interview" rooms. Applicants completed 5 fifteen-minute interviews. Between each interview they returned to wait in the "hallway". When not being interviewed, applicants could join a virtual tour with fellows. Faculty scored interviewees in Google. | Zoom, Google docs, administrator to move people into rooms per schedule | 1 | ND | Applicants reported an improved flow in 2020 compared to 2019. No significant differences in other reported indicators when compared to 2019. Faculty were impressed and reported an "excellent" overall impression. | Took away cost for program and applicants. No travel requirements, though downside is can't get to know location. 1 min warning before interviews concluded was awkward. Ability to maximize faculty members participation. | "The virtual interview served to match the in-person interview of the prior year, while maintaining the recommended objectives of social distancing." |
| Mouli et al. | Effectiveness of simulation-based teaching of ventilatory management among non-anesthesiology residents to manage COVID 19 pandemic - A Quasi experimental cross-sectional pilot study | May | GME | Residents;  n=26 | Multi-disciplinary | Asia | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Ensure non-anesthesiology trainees knowledgeable and prepared for ventilatory management in COVID-19 patients | A 7-hour teaching module was developed to train non-anesthesiologist ventilatory management. 3 hours of lectures (ABG, basics of ventilation, ventilation strategies in COVID patients), 1 hour of audio-video sessions, 1 hour of demonstrations as well as hands-on training and 2 hours of assessment with direct observation and feedback by anesthesiology faculty. COVID pneumonia was modeled through high fidelity human patient simulator. Followed by debriefing. | Course ran over 4 days, human patient simulator | 1; 2a; 2b | ND | Increased knowledge (pre-post). 88.4% met or exceeded expectations as per the training objectives. 11.6% were borderline or below expectation. Learner satisfaction (highly satisfied): 84, 96, 100% for 3 modules. 84.5% felt confident or very confident in interpreting ABG. 65.3% were confident maneuvering mechanical ventilation and 96.15% were very confident using PPE during intubation of COVID-19 patients. | ND | A planned teaching module in personal protection of health care workers and ventilation management helps to train non-anesthesiologists more effectively as a part of COVID-19 preparedness. Simulation with debriefing based training is the best alternative in the present pandemic and will also ensure the safety of HCPss. |
| Munshi et al. | An online clinical examination for fellowship certification during the COVID-19 pandemic | June | GME | Fellows; n=433 | N/A | Middle East | National regulatory body (Saudi Commission for Health Specialties) | Assessment | Assess candidate knowledge using an online exam format for high-stakes certification / licensure | Saudi certification exam moved online. Exam blueprinted against learning outcomes. 4 virtual stations lasting 15 minutes each. Some scenarios had enhanced reality features (e.g., data, radiographic images, videos) built in. Proctors admitted examiners and candidates to each virtual station. Examiners moved stations and proctors and candidates remained to ensure exam security. Assessed with checklists | ExamHD, 72 proctors, 232 examiners | 1 | ND | "96% of examinees and 91% of examiners reported satisfaction with how the examination contents reflected real practice" | Need to do dry runs to test technical aspects; reduced costs / travel | Online examination solved a certification emergency. It appears online case vignette assessments are acceptable to examinees and examiners |
| Naidoo et al. | Confronting the challenges of anatomy education in a competency-based medical curriculum during normal and unprecedented times (COVID - 19 pandemic): Gagne, Peyton and Mento to the rescue | June | UME | 1st year medical students;  n=172 | Anatomy | Middle East | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Apply pedagogical framework to allow anatomy education to continue in virtual environment | Applied a pedagogical framework for blended learning. Designed a social media application 'interactome' to allow different steps in blended learning process. Following a flipped classroom format - didactics and demonstration videos were provided asynchronously in advance on MS teams or YouTube, then learners came together in small groups for case discussions. A faculty instructor moderated discussion in Microsoft Teams and WhatsApp. | MS Teams, WhatsApp, YouTube. Extensive instructor training required. Reduced number of cadavers needed. | 1; 2b | ND | Overall positive feedback from students. The framework led to a trend towards better performance in summative exams in this preliminary evaluation. | Instructors reluctant to adopt and modify their teaching approaches (created training for this). Group dynamics can become an issue if students become distracted - may need peer tutor in group. Approach may work better if also combined with radiology. | Able to teach anatomy during unprecedented times. Experienced reluctance from tutors to adapt to new delivery method (flipped classroom) but have designed further training to help combat this. Online learning may solve issue of a lack of cadavers in middle eastern countries. |
| Newcomb et al. | Building Rapport and Earning the Surgical Patient's Trust in the Era of Social Distancing: Teaching Patient-Centered Communication During Video Conference Encounters to Medical Students | June | UME | Students, faculty, observers; n=11 | General Surgery | USA | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Design an effective online communication skills training for students entering surgical specialties | 2-hour virtual class focused on telecommunication held on Zoom. Following a brief didactic component about building virtual rapport and trust, students and faculty discuss patient centered communication experiences. Students then participate in two 15-minute role plays (Table 1: a surgical clinic consult and disclosure of a surgical complication). Faculty and peer observers then provide feedback. | 2-hour zoom session. 2 facilitators. 1 volunteer simulated patient with acting training. No info on prep time. | 1; 2a | Generated telecommunication best practice suggestions from the debriefs | Overall positive feedback. Student confidence improved in all domains of video communication (Figure 1). Particularly liked the interactive aspects to retain focus and the real-time feedback from faculty with direct observation. | Increased focus is required to communicate empathy and concern on video call. Patient distress was more difficult to interpret. Decreased ability for eye contact and physical touch may be mitigated by use of real time feedback as a method of emotional support, similar to observation that increased vocalization by student interviewer demonstrated attention to and emotional involvement in a patient's story. | Telemedicine is a promising area for expansion and session received positive feedback. Aim to expand it over curriculum. |
| Niburski & Niburski | A corona virus tracker for clinicians and students: Assessing education during an evolving phenomenon | May | Mixed | Healthcare practitioners, general public;  n=250 | Inter-professional | Canada | University | Other, information curation | Create curated online resource about COVID so healthcare practitioners and public can access accurate information | A curated information resource was created: whohascoronavirus.com. The site contained daily briefings from the WHO displaying death rates, recovery rates, active cases, and total cases. Clinical information regarding treatment modalities, radiographic images, etc. was summarized from the Journal of the American Medical Association (JAMA). | ND | 1; 2a | ND | Healthcare practitioners reported improvement in general knowledge (2.3 ± 0.4 to 4.4 ± 0.6, p<0.01), improvement in understanding of the epidemiological situation of the corona virus (1.8 ± 1.1 to 4.5 ± 0.3, p<0.01), improvement in clinical treatment (3.4 ± 0.4 to 4.0 ± 0.3, p<0.05) | When facts are appropriately sorted, managed and displayed, there is greater understanding by physicians and the public. Technologies need to be nimble to ensure unproven treatments don't get excessive "airtime". | This tracker helped provide accurate information in timely manner. During uncertainty, technologies have to be limber, worked with daily, and enable the highest level of accurate information. |
| O'Connell et al. | Effective Use of Virtual Gamification During COVID-19 to Deliver the OB-GYN Core Curriculum in an Emergency Medicine Resident Conference | June | GME | Residents;  n=36 | Emergency Medicine | USA | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Employ virtual gamification to enhance resident learning | Novel virtual game modeled after the TV show “So You Think You Can Dance?” Starts with a warm-up (where all players engage individually) and several rounds of team play with rapid-fire OB-GYN questions and cases. 2 teams play in each Zoom breakout room with answers judged by faculty. Teams are gradually eliminated to a final face-off, where the audience decides the winner. | Zoom, Kahoot | 1; 2b | ND | 87% enjoyed the activity, 95% reported being engaged, 95% reported learning new knowledge. | Further time and facilitator training were needed. Challenging to communicate with facilitators once in breakout rooms. | Virtual gamification was effective and well received. |
| Parker et al. | Remote Anatomic Pathology Medical Student Education in Washington State | August | UME | 3rd and 4th year medical students;  n=70 | Pathology | USA | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Provide remote anatomic pathology elective | 2-week, interactive, online organ system-based anatomic pathology course: Activities are tailored to the no pathologist future clinician, emphasizing basic microscopy and pathology terminology. Lectures delivered via Zoom. Multiple strategies to increase engagement while distance learning employed, including flipped classroom, screen annotation, case-based discussions and slide presentations (via online digital platform PathPresenter.net). | Zoom, PowerPoint, PathPresenter, Canvas, Microsoft Teams. 2 months to develop course. 3 course faculty, TAs and Canvas administrators. | 1; 2a; 2b | ND | Feedback overwhelmingly positive. Preliminary results suggest increase in pathology knowledge and elevated student opinions about pathology. 10-fold increase in students undertaking pathology placement (as opposed to face to face placement). 2 students now interested in career in pathology | Initial concerns that students may take passive approach. Addressed this by using case-based scenarios, annotate function on PathPresenter and flipped classroom model. Reliance on technological interactive tools to enhance synchronous learning: annotation function, webcam use, virtual slide sessions gave biggest impact. | Online learning has made pathology learning accessible for medical students. Lessons from this can be used to expand into 4-week course with laboratory-based elements. Can be used in future for other non-pandemic related barriers to learning. |
| Pasricha et al. | Remote corneal suturing wet lab: Microsurgical education during the COVID-19 pandemic | August | GME | Residents;  n=10 | General surgery | USA | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Examine the feasibility and efficacy of a remote wet lab for microsurgical education | Randomized control trial of simulated corneal suturing task for penetrating keratoplasty with and without remote synchronous feedback. Residents sutured porcine corneas via Zoom using a smartphone connected to a microscope with or without remote ophthalmology attending feedback. 2 graders assessed the pig eye outcomes once complete. | Zoom, microscope | 1, 2b | ND | Residents in both groups more comfortable with corneal suturing after the wet lab and found it effective. Objective corneal suture performance (suture length, tension, depth) was similar in both groups. | ND | Remote wet lab is feasible and effective for training residents in microsurgical techniques. |
| Patel et al. | Utility of a webinar to educate trainees on UK core surgical training (CST) selection – A cross sectional study and future implications amidst the COVID-19 pandemic | Sept-ember | GME | Residents and medical students; n=111 | General surgery | Europe | Academic hospital | Interviews (selection to residency) | Develop a webinar to educate trainees on Core Surgical Training selection in the UK | A free online webinar was held on a single day by a 2nd year core surgical trainee. The webinar covered the structure of the CST selection interview, portfolio preparation and advice on how to answer clinical knowledge, management and leadership questions during interviews. Survey was sent in advance via Google forms to participants to assess their baseline knowledge about the CST selection process. | Zoom, Google forms | 1 | ND | "Over half of respondents (55.0%) preferred a webinar over a face- to-face tutorial, appreciating the flexibility, convenience and zero financial cost associated." | Webinar experience heavily influenced by internet capability | "Webinars have been underused in preparation for CST applications. Preparation for CST application may become increasingly reliant on online materials, which may result in an increased demand for high quality, engaging and informative webinars." |
| Pennell et al. | Live-streamed ward rounds: a tool for clinical teaching during the COVID-19 pandemic | May | UME | medical students  n=60 | OB-GYN | Oceania | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Maintain clinical clerkship model of OB-GYN education whilst medical students are excluded from the hospital | Phase 1: remote observation (assess and analyze) - student participates via video on a mobile phone, including discussion before and after a patient visit. Student is shown patient data and records on video platform. Phase 2: student preparation (evaluate and synthesize) - student takes notes during rounds and seeks missing medical information. Phase 3: remote case-based ward round presentation (construct and justify) - 3-40 students engage for 60-90 minutes via videoconferencing. Students present cases and an educator facilitates discussion. | Approval required from hospital executive. Consent taken for each patient. Skype for business used for student to attend virtually. Extra time taken on ward round by doctors. 60-90-minute virtual clinical round requires facilitator. | 1 | Series of recommendations for including virtual ward rounds in remote teaching (Table 3) | Feedback generally positive from 24 students. Development allowed continuation of placements despite restrictions, clinical case discussion round allowed for further reflection which is not normally possible onwards, allowed for larger number of students to be involved than on a normal ward round. | "The program may potentially slow downward rounds. There is risk of technological limitations. There is inability to observe or participate in physical examination. There is a loss of some of the valuable elements of the informal curriculum on ward round (e.g., exemplary professional values, behavior and collegiality via positive role modelling)." | Provided an opportunity for students to continue to develop their clerkship skills and was rapidly implemented. Can be applicable to all areas of medicine. |
| Prasad et al. | Online interprofessional simulation for undergraduate health professional students during the COVID-19 pandemic | Sept-ember | UME | 4th year medical students, midwifery students;  n=71 | OB-GYN | Oceania | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Understand role of synchronous remote learning through simulation and impact on interprofessional interactions | ONE-sim interprofessional workshop covering maternal and neonatal emergencies, PPE and crisis resource management. Students given pre-reading and access to online videos on maternal emergencies prior to the session. Workshop structure: 1) Initial briefing (5 min), 2) Three Scenarios (20 min each), 3) Debrief (40 min). Workshop was led by a team of four (obstetrician, pediatrician, 2 midwives with extensive clinical and teaching experience), who simulated the emergency scenarios, which were live streamed to students via video conference. | Workshop led by team of 4. Zoom. | 1 | ND | "Students reacted positively to the online simulation and interacted collaboratively with each other during the video conference (Table 1)." | Live streaming the scenario helps it most closely simulate the face to face impromptu sessions and what emergencies look like in real life, but it is more resource and time intensive and less optimized than a prerecorded video. The authors ultimately decided to use prerecorded videos for future iterations. | IPE can be achieved in a useful and meaningful way using online platforms. May be useful ongoing post-pandemic. Needs further evaluation. |
| Prigoff et al. | Medical Student Assessment in the Time of COVID-19 | Sept-ember | UME | Clerkship medical students; n=19 | General Surgery | USA | Academic hospital | Assessment | Develop and online open book end of clerkship exam | Students took the clinical skills exam (CSE) open book, at home, and unproctored and the National Board of Medical Examiners (NBME) clinical subject or "shelf" exam at home proctored. Grading was adjusted by comparing the last 3 years of data. | ND | 1, 2b | ND | "The COVID-interrupted group scored higher on CSE, NBME exam, and performance evaluations (CSE:75.2 vs 68.7, shelf:68.0 vs 64.0, performance evaluation: 2.96 vs 2.78). The % of students with honors was marginally higher in the COVID group (42% vs 32%). 7 students stated they would have preferred closed-book CSE, citing drawbacks such as modifying exam prep, being discouraged from thinking prior to searching online, second guessing answers." | ND | "During the initial outbreak of COVID-19, we found that an open book exam and a virtually proctored shelf exam was a reasonable option. However, to avoid adjustments and student dissatisfaction, we would recommend virtual proctoring if available." |
| Rasouli et al. | Virtual Spine: A Novel, International Teleconferencing Program Developed to Increase the Accessibility of Spine Education During the COVID-19 Pandemic | August | Mixed | Physicians, fellows, residents, medical students; n=995 | Multi-disciplinary | International | Multi-institutional collaboration | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Address potential disparities in the access to spine education created by the COVID-19 pandemic across physicians and HCW in spine-related specialties across the globe. | Virtual Global Spine Conference (VGSC) had biweekly virtual meetings, hosted through the Zoom with various expert speakers (Orthopedic surgeons, neurosurgeons, neuroradiologists, etc.). All lectures were recorded and archived on YouTube and on the main conference website. | Zoom | 1 | ND | Since the launch of VGSC, more than 1000 surgeons, trainees, and other spine specialists have registered for the program. Surveys were sent to the participants early on with 168 responders - 92% viewed the content as highly valuable to their practice and 94% would continue participating in VGSC post COVID. | Many participants expressed their desire for virtual spine education to continue post COVID-19. Extra precautions are needed when dealing with virtual platforms because of potential cyber-security threats - 'Zoom bombing' as an example in this paper | Inequalities exist in the availability and access of these meetings to those who practice in countries outside the US. The early success and positive reception of the VGSC suggests this educational model can be emulated by other medical and surgical specialties to encourage national and international education and collaboration. |
| Rastegar Kazerooni et al. | Peer mentoring for medical students during the COVID-19 pandemic via a social media platform | April | UME | Medical students;  n=381 | ND | Middle East | University | Well-being / mental health / learner support | “Support students’ understanding of crisis management, self‐mental care and other principal measures in order to strengthen the students' coping skills and mental preparedness” | Senior medical students instructed juniors to cope with anxiety through recommendation of stress managements techniques, exercise, maintaining social groups, time management and strategies to cope with shift to online learning under supervision of faculty through a social media platform | 10 senior medical students with 40 hours of training each during previous 3 years. Faculty supervision | 1 | ND | 71% junior students believed the platform had a significant impact | Senior students can provide useful and timely input and it helps them grow also | “Peer mentorship can teach medical students skills needed to be physicians” |
| Recht et al. | Preserving Radiology Resident Education During the COVID-19 Pandemic: The Simulated Daily Readout | August | GME | Residents;  n=32 | Radiology | USA | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Preserve radiology case volumes and variety for radiology residents via the creation of "simulated daily readout" (SDR). | Simulated'' daily readouts (SDRs) were created to ensure readout experiences continued using a separate PACS filled with past radiology studies. The SDR was the primary focus of each rotation, as residents were not involved in 'live' cases - with aims to mimic a 'normal day' with an expectant proportion of normal and abnormal cases as determined by each subspecialty's consensus experience. | Initial design and build of the SDR environment took 7 information technology analysts 450 hours to complete. “20-30 hours” for faculty to develop cases, significant compute and IT resources | 1 | ND | Residents and teaching faculty felt strongly that the SDR initiative mitigated the COVID-19 negative impact on resident education. SDR mimics a resident's daily work on rotations and preserved resident education during COVID. The overall effectiveness of SDR was rated high to very high by the majority of residents and faculty alike, exceeding the resident expectations of this educational resource. | The most common shared concerns from both residents and faculty were the lack of patient history and access to prior imaging exams during SDR case dictation. | "The development of the SDR provided an effective method of preserving the educational value of the daily readout experience of radiology residents, despite severe decreases in imaging exam volume and case mix diversity during the COVID-19 pandemic. |
| Rose et al. | Physically distant, educationally connected: Interactive conferencing in the era of COVID‐19 | April | GME | Residents n=1080 | Emergency Medicine | USA | National organization | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Mimic a traditional in-person conference experience. | Academic Life in Emergency Medicine (ALiEM) Connect was created to mirror conference attendance, by incorporating a livestream video of presentations on Zoom with concurrent backchannel (informal, non-public, secondary conversation) discussions via Slack. Platform was large enough to host >1000 learners from 64 different programs. Six nationally known speakers taught during the 2-hour event, 20 minutes were allotted to each speaker. | Zoom, Slack | 1 | ND | "Overall, resident feedback was overwhelmingly positive. In comparison with prior in-person conference experiences, 84% of residents felt that ALiEM Connect was the same or better in quality and 93% enjoyed the event overall." | Preliminary survey data suggest that most residents were unfamiliar with Slack and may have felt reserved about navigating the platform during discussion. From the ALiEM Connect team’s perspective, the live format required in-the-moment adaptability to unanticipated obstacles. | Although learners must remain physically distant during the COVID-19 pandemic, ALiEM Connect offered a model for massive, online, interactive conferencing that allowed for social connection and academic engagement amongst residents. |
| Rotoli et al. | Emergency Medicine Residency Curricular Innovations: Creating a Virtual Emergency Medicine Didactic Conference | May | GME | Residents;  n=41 | Emergency Medicine | USA | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Adapt in-person EM education to an online learning platform and foster continued resident and faculty engagement. | EM curriculum with four didactic formats: 1) faculty-moderated virtual large group sessions, 2) faculty and chief resident-moderated virtual small-group sessions, 3) independent (asynchronous) learning activities, and 4) limited in-person critical procedure labs. Large-group sessions consisted of ~40 learners and ~2 faculty. Small-group format emphasized team learning, resident interaction, and connection. Independent learning activities emphasized flexibility, allowing learners to work at their own pace and focus on knowledge gaps. | ND | 1 | ND | 95.6% of comments were positive: The initial Q&A session was critical to outline the process. Participants appreciated the investment in change and were forgiving of glitches in implementation. The debriefing sessions were helpful to reduce stress. Participants were interested in continuing virtual conference even when social distancing is no longer required. Residents felt faculty were accessible, invested, and engaged. | Aligning conference needs with the functionality and limitations of the virtual platform was imperative. All EM education cannot be taught online. Variable format was critical to maximize participant engagement while limiting the participant disconnect with online learning. Crucial to acknowledge the psychosocial impact of virtual learning and current pandemic by providing recurring updated pandemic content and debriefing time within conference. | "Expanding educational delivery beyond the physical classroom by shifting didactic conference to a virtual platform has diversified the way we teach. With early program leadership engagement, we developed innovative ways to virtually educate learners while acknowledging participant stress in the face of drastic change." |
| Roy et al. | A study on students' perceptions for online zoom-app based flipped class sessions on anatomy organized during the lockdown period of COVID-19 epoch | June | UME | Medical students; n=199 | Anatomy | Asia | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Implement a flipped classroom model on Zoom to teach Anatomy | Ten gross Anatomy topics and 10 histology slides (total 15 sessions; one session for each gross anatomy topics and five sessions covering two slides for each day) were discussed in flipped class mode. For each session, the text materials were shared with students on WhatsApp two days before. Students generated a list of questions from these materials. On the third day, face-to-face interactive classes were undertaken using the Zoom platform." | WhatsApp, Zoom | 1 | ND | 92% of students preferred sharing materials in advance. 2/3 desired asynchronous learning using YouTube videos. Internet connectivity was a major concern for 61%. Majority of the students felt overwhelmed with 6 day/week anatomy sessions. 77% did not want to continue with online sessions once face to face returned and 40% felt unable to keep up with the learning. | Challenges included lack of adequate preparation, infrastructural weakness, and lack of expertise of the participants. Concerns re: using the free version of zoom - are people joining who shouldn't be? Students wanted to use paid version to ensure security and for longer class length. | Most students did not want to continue with online education after the pandemic - likely due to poor connectivity and feeling overwhelmed by amount of sessions. The majority of students preferred in person learning, but also acknowledged that the switch to online teaching was somewhat rushed and future planning would help optimize it. |
| Sa-Couto & Nicolau | How to use tele simulation to reduce COVID-19 training challenges: A recipe with free online tools and a bit of imagination | June | UME | 5th year medical students;  n=8 | N/A | Europe | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Use tele simulation to promote a meaningful distance learning experience | Course was developed using freely available tools and delivered through teleconferencing. Consisted of an introductory lecture, several group dynamics, and participation in three emergency scenarios (gastro-intestinal bleeding, anaphylactic shock, and opioid overdose). Scenarios typical take 15 min with 45 min for debriefing. | Zoom, an online simulation game (i.e. Full-Code App), a software simulating a vital sign monitor (vitalsignSIM), | 1 | ND | 100% of learners felt it was a valuable learning experience and agreed it was comparable to face to face session. All students would like to continue teleconferencing sessions in the future, to compliment physical learning post the COVID pandemic. | Requires time and dedication. If not familiar with the program needs a few hours to get used to it. Session can be recreated with free resources available online. All wanted to see more tele simulation including as a complement to face-to-face activities post COVID. | "Tele simulation can be used to promote a meaningful, interactive simulation environment, even with limited physical resources. " "This strategy has high potential to be used in the transitional post-confinement period or as a future complement to physical settings. " |
| Sam et al. | High‐stakes, remote‐access, open‐book examinations | May | UME | Final year medical students | N/A | Europe | Academic hospital | Assessment | Convert closed book exams to remote and open book | Open book exams (OBEs) were constructed from the United Kingdom Medical Schools Council bank of single best answer examination questions to assess the candidate’s ability to integrate clinical reasoning and decision‐making skills. Psychometric analyses were conducted. Candidates could access the exams from anywhere. | ND | 2b | ND | Median mark for the OBEs was identical to the median mark for the last 3 years of CBEs | ND | Concerns about the use of OBEs in high‐stakes assessments may be unfounded. Remote OBEs present a viable alternative to traditional closed book exams if the questions appropriately assess the integration and synthesis of knowledge rather than factual recall. |
| Samueli et al. | Remote pathology education during the COVID-19 era: Crisis converted to opportunity | August | UME | 3rd and 4th year medical students;  n=59 | Pathology | Middle East | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Introduce surgical pathology to medical students and reinforce the pathological basis for disease | A remote pathology course was developed using whole slide images (WSI). Students were given remote access to university computers, with two freely available WSI viewers. Each topic was taught in a 4-part module: Self-assigned reading, lecture via Zoom, 5 question formative quizzes based on digital slides, and a frontal review of the slides via Zoom. 8 sessions offered over 2 weeks. | Zoom, "WSIs prepared using a Panoramic MIDI automated digital slide scanner (3DHistech)." CaseViewer 2.3 (3DHistech) and Aperio ImageScope 12.3.3 (Leica)." | 1 | ND | 68% noted how interesting the course was, how much the course improved their understanding of diseases, and how strongly they would recommend the course." The online format seems to be preferable to students. | "Due to the need for fast curriculum development, case selection was based largely on availability. " Technical challenges in accessing the slides was the primary disadvantage of the class. | Developers were able to use the crisis to expose students to areas of pathology they normally aren't exposed to. The course was worthwhile and can be utilized in the future even in non-pandemic times. |
| Sandhu et al. | Virtual Radiation Oncology Clerkship During the COVID-19 Pandemic and Beyond | Sept-ember | UME | Medical students;  n=26 | Radiation oncology | USA | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Develop and evaluate the impact of a virtual radiation oncology rotation. | 2-week virtual radiation oncology clerkship available to both home and visiting medical students. The virtual curriculum consisted of synchronous resident and faculty-led didactics on Zoom using the chat and polling features; virtual clinic telehealth encounters facilitated through Epic Systems VidyoConnect; student talks, and supplemental sessions, such as quality assurance rounds and multidisciplinary tumor boards via WebEx. | Canvas, Zoom, Epic Systems and VidyoConnect, WebEx. | 1, 2a | ND | Students found the clinic to be most valuable, followed by didactic lectures, journal club presentations, treatment planning sessions, and chart rounds. "All students agreed that the clerkship improved their understanding of radiation oncology and the role of a radiation oncologist." Most would recommend to their classmates. | Students requested didactics cover a broader range of disease sites, more virtual clinic experience, require cameras on to improve their attention, and more time for their end-of-clerkship talks, and attendance in chart rounds not to be mandatory because it was too fast paced and beyond their level of understanding. | "Our virtual clerkship was effective in increasing medical student interest in and knowledge about radiation oncology. These data will help optimize a new paradigm of virtual radiation oncology education for medical students during COVID-19 and beyond." |
| Shahrvini et al. | Pre-Clinical Remote Undergraduate Medical Education During the COVID-19 Pandemic: A Survey Study | June | UME | 1st and 2nd year medical students; n=268 | N/A | USA | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Transition pre-clerkship curriculum completely online | Preclinical curriculum entirely shifted to remote learning (Table 1). Organ system block lectures asynchronously viewed and final exams taken at home. Lab manuals posted for Anatomy and Histology and office hours provided. Clinical skills conducted remotely (minus the PE) with SPs. Problem based learning sessions given synchronously on Zoom. Clinical apprenticeships were cancelled. | n/a | 1 | ND | Most enjoyed the flexibility of the lectures being online. Most felt a profound impact of the loss of clinical exposure and stated that this reduced their motivation. 90% felt that lab-based learning was impacted - anatomy, pathology and ultrasound. | Students found the impact of losing clinic exposure was profound; they stated that these sessions were what motivated them during the more academic sessions. Most positive feedback was for the increased flexibility and the allowance of self-paced learning. Technical difficulties were a barrier to learning. Digital fatigue was high with some sessions lasting 3-4 hours. 50% of students wanted to continue with the pre-recorded videocasted lectures. | Remote learning had some negative impacts on pre-clinical learning, related to the loss of clinical experiences, loss of practical hands on experience in laboratory courses, and disconnectedness negatively impacting mental health. Positive aspects included more flexibility, opportunities to explore different learning resources, and time to focus on wellness. |
| Sharara-Chami et al. | In Situ Simulation: An Essential Tool for Safe Preparedness for the COVID-19 Pandemic | Sept-ember | Mixed | Residents, nurses, attendings;  n = 106 | Multi-professional | Middle East | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Ensure HCW are trained and prepared to tackle the challenges of the COVID-19 pandemic | In situ 15-minute simulation followed by a debriefing at the bedside. Goals of applying standard precautions of donning/doffing, recognizing person of interest early, collaborating with infection prevention and control infrastructure, performing a primary assessment, starting immediate treatment, alerting hospital of suspected COVID-19, obtaining adequate samples and diagnostics, and triaging. Sim scenarios were adapted from Laerdal Medical titled Infection Prevention and Control: Severe Acute Respiratory Infection due to COVID-19. | 2 weeks, using simulation equipment | 2a; 2b | QI: Identification of threats with recommended solutions. | STAT scores to assess technical and behavioral skills: 16.3 out of 30 for basic skills, 23.3 out of 56 for airway and breathing, 14 out of 50 for circulation, and 39 out of 52 for human factors. SET-M scores for change in attitudes with 95-98% strongly agreeing on effectiveness of prebriefing, scenario, and debriefing. | "We were able to identify latent threats related to the system: fog in goggles if N-95 masks are not tightly sealed preventing good vision, time needed for the anesthesia team to arrive and for PPE donning and doffing, and coping with staff shortage, e.g., one registered nurse at the bedside in the COVID unit and others." Team performance improved with repeated simulations. | "We recommend intensive in situ simulation interventions targeting multidisciplinary teams in the new spaces, assessing the knowledge and identifying gaps  that need to be addressed as well as latent threats that could be recognized through simulation before translating into actual patient care." |
| Shi et al. | A simulation training course for family medicine residents in China managing COVID-19 | June | GME | Residents;  n = 25 | Family Medicine | Asia | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Create a model to allow family medicine residents to experience a scenario of COVID-19, allowing them to learn and practice their knowledge and maximize capacities to respond, facilitating their ability to eventually make appropriate decisions. | Simulation developed over 1 month, delivered to 25 residents in groups of 5, which consisted of: pre-simulation survey, a 10-minute presentation to introduce the process of simulation and how to perform the task including what roles each participant would assume, the simulation itself, a debriefing, and a post-simulation survey. Pre-reading and presentations review on week prior to simulation. | 1 month to develop simulation. Simulation center and equipment at the university hospital. | 1; 2b | ND | Tables 1-3: All participants were satisfied and receptive to the learning experience. Pre-test and post-test results in the following categories: identification/ diagnosis (pre-test 19, post-test 24), infection prevention/ treatment (pre-test 55, post-test 58) and assessment of the referral/patient transportation (pre-test 12, post-test 14). P< 0.05 for all categories in two-tailed t-test. | Some of the clinical information could rapidly become obsolete. | The present study offers an alternative training opportunity for junior doctors to manage potential COVID-19 risks. |
| Singh et al. | Using Simulation to Assess Cardiology Fellow Performance of Transthoracic Echocardiography: Lessons for Training in the COVID-19 Pandemic | August | GME | Cardiology fellows;  n=23 | Cardiology | USA | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Design a simulation-based training and assessment in echocardiography as a useful adjunct to education when procedural volumes are low | Simulation-based scanning tasks using the 3D Systems Ultrasound Mentor simulation program and mannequin were created. Tasks were designed by the Advanced Echocardiography Training Director. A preset checklist of basic competencies expected for each task was developed. Fellows scanned and were given immediate feedback based on their performance. | 3D Ultrasound simulator and mannequin | 2b | ND | Training level and number of scans performed did not translate to significant differences in TTE scanning skill when assessed via simulation. Simulation-based training was sensitive to skill differences between expert sonographers and trainees and provided an opportunity for efficient, targeted, and direct feedback. | None | Simulation for TTE education should be considered as a curricular complement for cardiology fellowships. Simulation-based tasks can be modified and repeated over the course of training to document longitudinal progress objectively. |
| Singhi et al. | Medical Hematology/Oncology Fellows' Perceptions of Online Medical Education During the COVID-19 Pandemic | Sept-ember | GME | Hematology / Oncology fellows; n=42 | Hematology / Oncology | USA | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Transition to virtual instruction for didactics and continue with medical education | The academic program was transitioned to a fully virtual environment using the video conferencing WebEx software. Faculty deliver lectures live and use interactive features such as the chat box and virtual whiteboard. | WebEx | 1 | ND | Majority of fellows felt comfortable with the transition to an online learning. 1/3 reported that they were less focused, and nearly a 1/4 felt that they had learned less than during an in-person experience. Majority reported a change in social and interpersonal interactions. About 1/2 reported that it was easy/very easy to balance online attendance with personal or family commitments. | Review of the open-ended responses demonstrated that several respondents desired the use of an anonymous polling feature to encourage active participation during interactive review sessions. | Overall, most fellows felt comfortable with a transition to an online-only didactic curriculum. A pure-online educational approach has not yet been favored over the traditional in-person educational environment. |
| Sockalingam et al. | Responding to Health Care Professionals' Mental Health Needs During COVID-19 Through the Rapid Implementation of Project ECHO | July | CME | Healthcare professionals;  n=426 | Multi-professional | Canada | University partnership with community mental health centers | Well-being / mental health / learner support | Deliver support, resources, and mental health training to encourage and promote self-care for healthcare providers through virtual programming | Oregon Extension for Community Healthcare Outcomes (ECHO) Network tele mentoring program for rural frontline clinicians was adapted to support HCW caring for patients with COVID-19. Curriculum consisted of two 1-hour sessions per week that included: introductions, a mindfulness exercise, COVID-19 question and answer, a didactic presentation based on the curriculum topic, case based discussion to illustrate stress management skills, and a closing section based on health humanities education (e.g., poem or art) to stimulate reflection. Sessions were structured to balance information sharing and the development of skills to manage one’s own mental health and well-being. | Utilized an existing hub and spoke resource for building mental health capacity in under resourced settings | 1, 2b | ND | Session satisfaction (3.91-4.26 / 5) and self-efficacy (69.1-70.2 / 100) in healthcare providers (Table 1) | Rapid implementation was feasible based on pre-existing structure / network | "HCPs can experience significant psychological distress while delivering care during COVID-19... Virtually delivered tele-education programs, such as Project ECHO, can be rapidly implemented to provide HCP support and training on self-care using existing implementation frameworks and iterative curriculum design methods." |
| Steehler et al. | Implementation and Evaluation of a Virtual Elective in Otolaryngology in the Time of COVID-19 | July | UME | 3rd year medical students;  n=12 | Oto-laryngology (ENT) | USA | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Develop a virtual otolaryngology medical student elective to teach the basic tenets of otolaryngology and increasing exposure to the specialty." | "1-week virtual otolaryngology curriculum" conducted via home conferencing software. Program consisted of "lectures, case-based learning, and walk-throughs of surgical videos" Didactic sessions with faculty and residents via Zoom. ENT videos covering basic anatomy and exam techniques provided. Pre-readings prior to each session. 2 hours of morning lecture, 2 hours of afternoon lecture. Students also attend department grand rounds. | Faculty, residents and senior medical students came together 4 weeks prior to elective. Zoom | 1, 2a, 2b | ND | Pre-post results demonstrated learning. 92% of students reported increased understanding. Scores on summative assessments were significantly higher (P <.001). 92% of students reported either ‘increased’’ or ‘‘greatly increased’’ interest in otolaryngology post course. Students appreciated course organization, formative assessments, and case-based learning" | Limitations included that the course was developed rapidly and couldn’t be piloted, which resulted in technical difficulties, and the assessment was also not comprehensive. | "Our experience suggests that virtual curricula can be utilized to enhance surgical education of medical students even after the resumption of clinical duties, especially for surgical specialties that would otherwise receive little attention." |
| Steeves-Reece et al. | Rapid Deployment of a Statewide COVID-19 ECHO Program for Frontline Clinicians: Early Results and Lessons Learned | May | CME | Physicians, NPs, PAs;  n=737 | Family Medicine | USA | State Chief Medical Officer | Well-being / mental health / learner support | Provide tele mentoring to rural and urban clinicians to connect and share emerging information on COVID-19 | Oregon Extension for Community Healthcare Outcomes (ECHO) Network tele mentoring program for rural frontline clinicians: 4 sessions set up once weekly for all comers. Featured a community presenter sharing their on-the-ground experience regarding best practices and lessons learned. Forum to connect ideas, share stories, experiences, and suggestions, as well as questions in the chat. | 1 week to set up, 4 weekly sessions, online. | 1 | ND | 94% of participants rated sessions as good, very good, or excellent. | Previously established network (systems and relationships: support system, including a project manager, IT support, and a registration/communication platform) were paramount to develop a program rapidly. | Public health emergencies require rapid delivery of high-quality information to HCPss, including those in rural communities. Project ECHO effectively met the urgent needs and reached a large proportion of the state. |
| Sud et al. | Undergraduate ophthalmology teaching in COVID-19 times: Students' perspective and feedback | July | UME | Medical students | Ophthal-mology | Asia | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (asynchronous) | Shift to online teaching of ophthalmology | Lectures converted into a virtual learning environment. PowerPoint presentations were uploaded to the shared area online and annotated with salient points. A WhatsApp group was created to allow sharing of relevant videos and reading material, to allow students to ask questions. MCQs administered. | Education management system (EMS) on the college website, PowerPoint lecture slides, WhatsApp group, Zoom. | 1 | ND | Most students felt this method was a suitable alternative for teaching. 18% felt that the MCQs helped them in self‐assessment. The main disadvantages were that this mode of teaching was not as interactive as classroom lectures (60%), and clarifications could not be addressed instantly (29%). | ND | This platform is not a replacement for clinical and face to face teachings but is a method of continuing education during the times of the pandemic. |
| Suppan et al. | Effect of an E-Learning Module on Personal Protective Equipment Proficiency by Prehospital Personnel: Web-Based, Randomized Controlled Trial. Journal of Medical Internet Research | August | CME | EMTs and emergency physicians;  n=176 | Emergency medicine | Europe | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Improve PPE selection through a gamified E-learning module | A gamified e-learning module with 19 sections and 7 embedded video sequences was developed. Within the module, trigger mechanisms are used to check that the user had accessed and completed all required steps before being allowed to proceed to the following section. Two quizzes were created, with 10 MCQs each. | Online platform | 1, 2a, 2b | ND | Though baseline proportion of adequate PPE choice was high (75%, IQR 50%-75%), the donning sequence was in most cases incorrect. After either intervention, adequate choice of PPE increased significantly in both groups (P<.001). Confidence in the ability to use PPE was maintained in the e-learning group (P=.27) but significantly decreased in the control group. | Participants were dissatisfied with the e-learning format. There was no added value for gamified e-module, possible due to the characteristics of the population, high baseline knowledge, lack of power, the negative effect of pre-test (serving as a primer), some surprising no significant difference in overall satisfaction with gamified e-module. | "Among prehospital personnel with an already high knowledge and experience regarding PPE use, both web-based study paths increased the rate of adequate choice of PPE. There was no major added value of the gamified e-learning module apart from preserving participants' confidence in their ability to use PPE." |
| Tang, Chen et al. | Maintaining Training with Self-Ultrasound During COVID-19 | July | GME | Radiology residents | Radiology | Asia | Academic hospital | Other | Maintain ultrasound training of radiology trainees | Self-ultrasound was introduced to maintain ultrasound training, using ultrasound machines already available in the radiology department. A list of feasible self-ultrasound parts was determined. | Ultrasound machine | 2b | ND | "Current residents had lower ultrasound scores across all three components at baseline... Scores of current residents improved by mid posting (to 3.1/5.0, 3.1/5.0, and 3.2/5.0 respectively compared to the previous group’s mid posting scores of 3.0/5.0,3.1/5.0, and 3.7/5.0) and showed no statistical difference from the previous batch (p > 0.06). | Residents got to feel the patient experience, but not much significant pathology seen. | "Self-ultrasound sessions can be used to maintain ultrasound training during periods requiring reduced human interaction." |
| Tang, New et al. | Zooming for cells: Tele-education of histopathology residents during the COVID-19 pandemic | August | GME | Histopathology residents, medical officers, fellows | Pathology | Asia | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Develop virtual histopathology teaching sessions during the pandemic and assess its suitability as a replacement | Virtual (1-2 hour) histopathology teaching sessions enabled interactive, 'real-time' review of images with learners. A microscopy camera was attached to a single-header microscope, connected to an internet-enabled laptop which allowed images to be projected on the screen which was then 'screen-shared' on Zoom. | Zoom | 1 | ND | 93% of respondents (11 respondents to the survey) were satisfied with using Zoom, with 18% showing high satisfaction. Participants commented that this system was a good replacement for the more traditional means of teaching. | Pros - set up allowed greater attendance, especially from those posted to different hospitals. Cons - technical / hardware issues; poor internet connection, poor image resolution and voice quality, lag in audio and image, and potential issues regarding data security / information governance | Beyond COVID-19, there are advantages to this novel method of teaching histopathology, including allowing residents who are posted away from teaching hospitals to participate in virtual sessions and to involve other expert educators from other parts of the world. |
| Thum DiCesare et al. | Democratizing Access to Neurosurgical Medical Education: National Efforts in a Medical Student Training Camp During COVID-19 | August | UME | Medical students;  n=305 | Neuro-surgery | USA | Multi-institutional collaboration | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Developed the first live, cross-institutional virtual training camp to deliver standardized neurosurgical educational content to medical students during the pandemic | 8 neurosurgery residencies participated in a 1-day virtual neurosurgery training camp. They used Zoom for breakout rooms for mentorship sessions. They covered professional, academic, and technical aspects of neurosurgery. | Increased potential participant numbers with reduced cost. | 1, 2a | ND | "Of the respondents, 65.0% reported improved neurosurgical knowledge, 79.8% reported decreased anxiety about sub internships and interviews, 82.5% reported increased enthusiasm about neurosurgery, and 100% desired a future annual virtual training camp because of the increased accessibility and decreased cost." | Strengths included the variety of speakers, the ability to casually interact with attendings and residents from numerous programs, the efficiency of the event to deliver a large and varied amount of content, and the ease of transition between sessions. Areas to improve included lengthening the event, having more directed didactic sessions, and providing more advice on how to be an outstanding sub intern or interviewee. | "This virtual structure improved resource usage and scalability compared with in-person training, maintained social distancing, and democratized access to standardized, specialized content not often available through traditional medical curricula. Even as a supplement to in-person events, the virtual training model could be implemented by national medical societies, which might significantly increase medical students’ preparedness for, and education in, neurosurgery and other subspecialties." |
| Tsang et al. | From bedside to website: A neurological clinical teaching experience | July | UME | Medical students | Neurology | Asia | University | Telehealth | Provide students with learning opportunities from real patient scenarios | Students took a complete history via Zoom on a patient, a tutor helped them perform a "physical exam", and then discussion of investigation and management took place. | Zoom | 1 | ND | “Students’ feedback has been positive, and most found website teaching comparable to or better than bedside teaching in fulfilling learning outcomes, except for PE skills” | Able to do enough examination to facilitate discussion. ‘Annotate’ and ‘Remote control’ in conjunction with split screen enabled session to be very interactive | "Telehealth clerking is an addition to the existing curriculum and website teaching may continue to have a role after the pandemic, as telemedicine consultation become an essential skill for the next generation of practitioners." |
| Verma et al. | Online Teaching During COVID-19: Perception of Medical Undergraduate Students | June | UME | 4th year medical students;  n=200 | N/A | Asia | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Implementation of an online teaching program to continue medical education despite the pandemic. | Google Meet was used to deliver 60-minute daily lectures online rather than face to face as previously done. | Google meet | 1 | ND | Almost all of the students found the online sessions to be relevant and tailored to learning needs (n = 127 (99%)). Seventy-five (57%) students felt these classes safe, comfortable and enjoyable. Still many of them (120 (92%)) felt these classes as good utilization of time and reading on those topics decreased their stress about COVID-19." "Sixty-two (47%) students want online classes to be made part of their curriculum after COVID." | Feedback identified issues such as teachers not being technology friendly, a lack of interactive teaching, and easy distraction and technical issues. Thought to be time efficient. | "Although classical “classroom teaching” is not possible to replicate through online teaching, still it is a cheap and feasible method which helps to gain knowledge, maintaining routine and improving morale of teachers and students." |
| Vining et al. | Virtual Surgical Fellowship Recruitment During COVID-19 and Its Implications for Resident/Fellow Recruitment in the Future | April | GME | Residents;  n=20 | Surgical Oncology | USA | Academic hospital | Interviews (selection to residency) | Outline the successful implementation of and processes behind a virtual interview day for fellowship recruitment | Zoom used for virtual interviews. Applicants could go to an optional prep session with the program director and staff, day lasted 4 houses. | Zoom | 1 | ND | "Seventy-ﬁve percent (12/16) of applicants and all faculty respondents (12/12) stated the interview process was ‘very seamless’ or ‘seamless’. Overall, the majority of applicants expressed a preference for live interviews (11/16; 68.8%). Half of the faculty interviewers (6/12; 50.0%) preferred live interviews; one-third (4/12; 33.3%) favored video interviews." | Cost and time savings | "Current circumstances related to the COVID-19 pandemic require fellowship programs to adapt and conduct virtual interviews" |
| Wenhui, et al. | Whole-Process Emergency Training of Personal Protective Equipment Helps Healthcare Workers Against COVID-19 | June | CME | Healthcare workers;  n = 263 | Multi-professional | Asia | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Develop an emergency training program of PPE for general HCW who may be under the threat COVID-19 and evaluate the effect of the program. | Authors devised a training session for HCW. The training process was divided into three sections: (1) lecture and demonstration; (2) simulation exercise; (3) test and evaluation. In the lecture, the skills were demonstrated, and participants practiced. In the simulation section, the participants were assessed on ability to carry out tasks in the simulation. In the test section, trainees had to complete the simulation in pairs. | PPE for practice | 2b | ND | Post-test scores were significantly improved when compared with the pre-test scores. Among all PPE, N95 respirator and protective cover all needed training most. Meanwhile, ‘‘proficiency level’’ and ‘‘mutual check & help’’ also needed to be strengthened as independent scoring points. | HCWs prefer surgical masks in daily work which are more comfortable and breathable. N95 and PPE easy to lose points because seldom used in ordinary times and both the donning and doffing (especially) are complicated. | This training program significantly improved the performances of participants. It may therefore be applied for general HCWs on a larger scale |
| Wenlock, et al. | Low-fidelity simulation of medical emergency and cardiac arrest responses in a suspected COVID-19 patient - an interim report | July | GME | Resident physicians and nurses;  n = 56 | Multi-professional | Europe | Academic hospital | Simulation (training for treating patients with COVID-19) | Pilot a low-fidelity COVID-19  simulation to improve our understanding of the role simulation can play, offer a safe training environment, identify problems with current protocols while providing workable solutions | The team organized two in-situ simulation scenarios: 1) a presumed decompensated heart failure who also has COVID-19 symptoms, and becomes unresponsive at the start of the case; 2) an acutely unwell patient who deteriorates into cardiac arrest mid-simulation and is a PUI for COVID-19; two facilitators: 1) run the scenario, 2) observe and provide feedback. The simulations were often observed by non-participating members of the ward team to maximize interprofessional learning. | Hospital simulation center equipment and four full-time teachers and five training assistants. | 2a | QI / policy change: added a fifth member to COVID response team (runner) | Staff reported being significantly less prepared to respond to an emergency in a patient with COVID-19. The simulations significantly improved participants’ confidence in responding to emergencies in patients with suspected COVID-19. Numerous challenges were identified along the themes of equipment, personnel, communication and procedures. | Participants requested more simulations of the same type on a regular basis to improve skills, and to run simulations that involved different skillsets such as setting up CPAP. Participants noted that four people in the room were too few (compressions, defibrillation, procedures, team lead, airway, and room runner needs), which led to development of a fifth person to be runner. | Low-fidelity simulation can provide relevant and timely information on how prepared health systems and their workforce are to respond to emergencies. |
| Wlodarczyk, et al. | Development and emergency implementation of an online surgical education curriculum for a General Surgery program during a global pandemic: The University of Southern California experience | Sept-ember | GME | Residents; n=35 | General Surgery | USA | Academic hospital | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Present a novel online curriculum for incorporation into traditional surgical educational programs to facilitate knowledge retention through the incorporation of a multimodal educational platform. | A multimodal curriculum was developed and implemented. Zoom was used as the foundation of the interactive e-curriculum. Residents participated in 1-2 online activities. The content was created to stimulate both passive and active learning in a flipped classroom setting. Educational activities included - (1) Faculty lectures, (2) Resident topic discussion, (3) Journal club, and (4) Question review sessions. All sessions were recorded and accompanying presentation materials were made available to all residents. | Zoom | 1 | ND | 71.9% of residents and 16.6% of faculty reported improved resident participation while none reported decreased levels of participation (p < 0.001). 87.1% of residents and 66.7% of faculty preferred the online curriculum... Completed...practice questions per resident increased." | Faculty and residents voiced their preference for the online educational model. The ability to attend from various locations and record for future viewing was highlighted. There was a discordance regarding participant engagement thought to be due to resident discomfort asking questions and presenting viewpoints online and faculty inability to assess audience engagement. | The "online educational curriculum demonstrates success and can serve as a model for online restructuring of resident education." |
| Xu, et al. | Virtual grand rounds as a novel means for applicants and programs to connect in the era of COVID-19 | Sept-ember | UME | Medical students;  n=18 | Urology | USA | Academic hospital | Interviews (selection to residency), Pivot to online learning (synchronous) | Investigate the feasibility and utility of video conferencing technology as an opportunity for applicants to interact with faculty from outside programs | Applicants were randomized to 6 urology programs to give a virtual grand round talk. "Presentations were recorded and analyzed to determine audience engagement. Students were surveyed regarding perceived utility of virtual grand rounds. Faculty were surveyed to determine system usability….and ability to evaluate the applicant." | Zoom, Web | 1 | ND | 100% student satisfaction rate with virtual grand rounds. A majority felt this was a useful way to learn about outside programs. Nearly half of faculty felt conﬁdent in their ability to evaluate the applicant | Not a standardized process | "Virtual grand rounds can be a useful means for medical students to express interest in programs as well as an additional marker for faculty to evaluate applicants" |
| Zhang, et al. | The evaluation of online course of Traditional Chinese Medicine for MBBS international students during the COVID-19 epidemic period. | June | UME | Medical students;  n=84 | N/A | Asia | University | Pivot to online learning (synchronous, asynchronous) | Investigate students’ perception of an online traditional Chinese medicine course, and assess online learning efficacy | Two online learning platforms, ZJU and Dingtalk, were used to teach a traditional Chinese medicine course synchronously and asynchronously. The course covered 32 lectures in eight weeks. Students consulted instructional materials, submitted assignments, and took exams. | Online learning platforms ZJU and Dingtalk | 1, 2a | ND | Participants preferred face-to-face learning (54.17%). Students felt the course brought benefits (mean 3.88, SD 0.87), and they were satisfied with the course content (mean 3.83, SD 0.95). Students’ TCM related knowledge and behaviors were significantly improved (all P < 0.001). Students’ awareness of the necessity of TCM education and their feeling of difficulty in learning TCM were strengthened. | Students reported enjoyed the ability to control the online lectures and to complete things asynchronously at their convenience. However, transition to remote learning requires time to adapt. Students felt less engaged/more distracted. The loss of hands-on activities and need for self-discipline on the part of the student also represent challenges. | "Online learning is a good alternative for TCM course of MBBS international students when classroom learning is suspended, whereas it cannot replace the need for onsite and face-to-face learning." |

UME = undergraduate medical education, GME = graduate medical education, CME = continuing medical education, Mixed = some combination of UME, GME, CME, HCW = health care workers, TOT = trainers of trainees, WHO = World Health Organization, ND = not described, N/A = not applicable, CMT = crisis management team, PPE = personal protective equipment, Q&A = question and answer, RT-qPCR = quantitative reverse transcription polymerase chain reaction, ICT = information communication technology, ACGME = Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Education, ENT = ear-nose-throat, IPE = interprofessional education, Re-ACT = Remote Advanced Communication Training, NP = nurse practitioners, PA = physician assistants, SP = standardized or simulated patient, ED = emergency department, ICU = intensive care unit, SARS = Severe acute respiratory syndrome, HIPPA = Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act, ACT = Advanced Communication Training, QI = quality indicators, PBL = problem based learning, PAPR = powered air-purifying respirator, APPCN = Association of Postdoctoral Programs in Clinical Neuropsychology, TPRAT = Trainee Pandemic Role Allocation Tool, MDI = multisite didactic initiative, AHA = American Heart Association, GERI-A-FLOAT = GERIAtrics Fellows Learning Online And Together, SAVEd = Self-isolAting Virtual Education, GP = General Practice, AMSER = Alliance of Medical Student Educators in Radiology, MCQ = multiple choice questions, WSI = whole slide imaging, MD = doctorate of medicine, PACS = secure picture archiving communication system, OSCE = objective structured clinical examination, AV = audio visual, VPN = virtual private network, LAPP = web‐mobile‐based platform to train laparoscopic surgeons remotely, TBL = team based learning, POPCoRN = Pediatric Overflow Planning - Contingency Response Network, ViSEG = Virtual Surgical Education Group, USMLE = United States Medical Licensing Examination, MAL = Master Adaptive Learner, CAPR = Controlled Air Purifying Respirators, ABG = arterial blood gases, OB-GYN = obstetrics and gynecology, JAMA = Journal of the American Medical Association, CST = core surgical training, CSE = clinical skills exam, NBME = National Board of Medical Examiners, VGSC = Virtual Global Spine Conference, SDR = "simulated daily readout, EM = emergency medicine, AliEM = Academic Life in Emergency Medicine, OBE = open book exam, WSI = whole slide images, STAT = Simulation Team Assessment Tool, SET-M = Simulation Effectiveness Tool, CBE = closed book exam, ECHO = Extension for Community Healthcare Outcomes, CPD = continuing professional development, TTE = Transthoracic Echocardiography, HCP = health care professional, EMS = Education management system, TCM = Traditional Chinese Medicine, MBBS = Medical Bachelor, Bachelor of Surgery